



December 3, 2019

TO THE HONORABLE MEMBERS OF THE SCHOOL COMMITTEE:

Report of Educational and Programmatic Review

Report: Attached is a redacted copy of the Educational and Programmatic Review dated July 30, 2019 that was conducted in response to School Committee Order C18-083.

Description: The attached is a redacted copy of the Educational and Programmatic dated July 30, 2019 that was conducted in response to School Committee Order C18-083. Please note that section of the Educational and Programmatic Review which are exempt from the public records law pursuant to M.G.L.c. 4, §7(26)(a) continue to be withheld pursuant to Exemption (a) of the Public Records Law under G.L. c. 71, §34D and 34E, which governs the release of student records and pursuant to Exemption (a) and (c), which exempts personnel information.

Supporting Data: Educational and Programmatic Review dated July 30, 2019

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be "KS" or "K. Salim", written in a cursive style.

Kenneth N. Salim, Ed.D.  
Superintendent of Schools



2

## LOUISON, COSTELLO, CONDON & PFAFF, LLP

DOUGLAS I. LOUISON\*  
PATRICK J. COSTELLO  
DAVID E. CONDON  
BRADFORD N. LOUISON\*\*  
STEPHEN C. PFAFF  
REGINA M. RYAN  
KATHLEEN E. CONNOLLY  
JOSEPH A. PADOLSKY\*

ATTORNEYS AT LAW  
101 SUMMER STREET  
BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS 02110

TELEPHONE: (617) 439-0305  
FACSIMILE: (617) 439-0325  
www.lcplaw.com

ALEXANDRA GRASKEPER\*\*  
MEGAN K. BAKER\*\*\*  
MATTHEW T. GOEPFRICH

\*ALSO ADMITTED IN ME  
\*\*ALSO ADMITTED IN RI  
\*\*\*ALSO ADMITTED IN FL

July 30, 2019

### EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMATIC REVIEW OF THE JANUARY 10, 2019 PANEL DISCUSSION

This report is prepared in response to the scope of services seeking a comprehensive review of the conduct of the classroom panel discussion on January 10, 2019 at the Cambridge Rindge & Latin School ("CRLS"), U.S. History II Honors Class taught by Mr. Kevin Dua.

#### I. Witnesses Interviewed

1. Kenneth N. Salim – Superintendent
2. Damon Smith – Principal CRLS
3. Gina Roughton – Assistant Director of Educational Technology
4. Mr. Kevin Dua – History Teacher CRLS
5. Emily Dexter – Cambridge School Committee Member
6. [REDACTED]
7. Steven Smith – Chief Information Officer for Cambridge Public Schools
8. [REDACTED]
9. [REDACTED]
10. Laurance Kimbrough<sup>1</sup> – School Committee Member

<sup>1</sup> Mr. Kimbrough appeared for his scheduled interview but advised that he did not want to answer any questions [REDACTED]

11. Tanya Milner – Dean of Curriculum for Learning in the History Department at CRLS

## II. Exhibits/Documents/Videos Reviewed

1. [REDACTED]
2. [REDACTED]
3. [REDACTED]
4. [REDACTED]
5. [REDACTED]
6. [REDACTED]

## 7. CRLS Policies

- a. Acceptable Use Policy for Computers
  - b. Community Resource Persons
  - c. Electronic Device User Agreement
  - d. Teaching About Controversial Issues
8. Emails from Ms. Dexter to Mr. Dua
  9. Email from Mr. Dua to panelists
  10. Email from Superintendent Salim to the District dated January 30, 2019
  11. Minutes of the School Committee Meeting dated February 5, 2019
  12. Minutes of School Committee Meeting dated April 2, 2019

## III. Summary of Report

This report is a review of the classroom panel discussion on January 10, 2019, and as defined at the April 2, 2019 School Committee meeting, it specifically addresses the following:

- the basis and context for the selection of the panel topic

- particulars relating to panel organization
- the connection between the panel discussion topic and the class syllabus and the CRLS History Department's curriculum
- Approval procedures associated with the panel conduction
- Selections and participation of panel participants
- Panel preparatory discussions, meetings and materials
- Student preparatory discussions, assignments and materials
- [REDACTED]
- Review of the immediate and subsequent follow up actions taken by school and district adults in response to the "n-word" being used in context with related school district and school committee policy

#### IV. Review

##### Background Information

1. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

2. The U.S. History II Honors class begins in September addressing freedom in the 1800s and goes chronologically through U.S. History concluding with America in our time (1992 to the present). [REDACTED]

3. For the school year 2018-2019, every student at CRLS received a Chromebook laptop. This was the first time that there had been a one-to-one distribution of laptops for all students. (Interview of Principal Smith).

4. The laptops have filters installed so if the students are doing online research, certain words are censored and cannot be researched. (*Id.*).

5. When the laptops were initially distributed in the fall of 2018 there was some pushback amongst the students because not everyone wanted to use the Chromebook laptops distributed by the school, and some wanted to use their own laptops. (*Id.*).

6. In addition, there was pushback amongst the students because the filtering of the laptops meant that students who went home and used their own computers had access to more information than the students who were limited to the use of the school issued laptop. (*Id.*).

7. CRLS has two filters on all computers. One is a firewall called the "SonicWall" and it is geared for schools and was installed approximately two years ago. (Interview of Mr. Steven Smith).

8. The second filter is called "Securely", also geared towards schools, and it specifically targets searches on the Chromebook laptops. (*Id.*).

9. Mr. Smith tried to obtain a list of all words that were censored or filtered by Securely but was denied this request because the list is copyright protected. (*Id.*).

10. The school is required to have filtering based on the federal mandate ERate in which schools are reimbursed for connectivity and hardware when they agree to provide specific filtering. (*Id.*).

11. Moreover, in order to meet the requirements of the federal Children Internet Protection Act, internet activity is filtered. (See Exhibit 7).

12. Occasionally, CRLS will "tweak" the words that are censored or filtered if a student or teacher provides a legitimate reason for the need to research a particular word. This is briefly addressed in the School's Acceptable Use policy (Interview of Mr. Smith and Exhibit 7).

13. When Mr. Dua's students began studying words at the beginning of the semester and wanted to research certain words for historical context, they were prevented from researching certain words due to the filters. (Interview of Mr. Dua).

**The Basis and Context of the Selection of the Panel Topic**

14. Mr. Dua requires his U.S. History Honor students to complete a semester project during the months of December and January. In January, he invites community members to his class to discuss the subject matter with the students. (Interview of Mr. Dua and Exhibit 9).

15. This year's panel topic for Mr. Dua's U.S. History II Honors class was twofold. First, the panelists were invited to partake in a discussion on the semester project entitled "Reclaiming N\*gger and C\*\*\*\*er: Defining Racial Context for Cambridge and America". (See Exhibit 5). Second, the panel topic addressed how "students' education may or may not be hindered with the newly 1:1 issued laptops "which, "blocked certain words ("nigger," "cracker" and "honky") but not other racial slurs. To better investigate how/why race is viewed in their education by specific persons..." (See Exhibit 9).

16. Mr. Dua and his students, after a brainstorming meeting, determined the panel topic because it was both on point with the project topic and also because it addressed the struggles they encountered when researching with the new laptops. (Interview of Mr. Dua [REDACTED])

**Particulars Relating to Panel Organization**

17. Mr. Dua and his students agreed that the panel invitees would include members of the School Committee, Superintendent Salim, Principal Smith and Ms. Roughton because they believed that these individuals had the most relevant information to the subject matter being discussed. Specifically, Mr. Roughton and Mr. Smith could share their knowledge of how the

filters are installed on the computers and the invitees could share their expertise on the project topic and the purpose and reasoning behind the filters on the computers. (See Exhibit 9).

18. Accordingly, Mr. Dua sent the email inviting these individuals to his classroom with a copy of the classroom assignment. (*Id.*).

**The Connection Between the Panel Discussion Topic and the Class Syllabus**

19. The panel discussion addressed how the power of words has shaped the history of the nation and how filters on the laptops may or may not hinder education. (See Exhibit [REDACTED] 9).

20. Mr. Dua prepared the US History II Honors syllabus in the summer of 2018. All students were provided a copy of the syllabus and they followed the nine units outlined in the syllabus throughout the academic year. ([REDACTED]).

21. As outlined in the syllabus, the students were required to prepare a semester project. As part of this project, the students were required to work in groups and prepare a term paper and produce a mini-documentary. The goal of the month-long assignment was to have the students resolve U.S. History's hidden stories on racism while analyzing historical context and how it is relevant. (Interview of Mr. Dua).

22. The assignment was entitled, "Reclaiming N\*gger and C\*\*\*\*er: Defining Racial Context for Cambridge and America" and this was the primary subject of the panel discussion.  
[REDACTED]

23. Mr. Dua picked this topic, "as it addressed the impact that words have on history" and how the power of word/language, has shaped our nation, post-Civil War to now (via laws, protests, social media etc)." (Interview of Mr. Dua [REDACTED]).

24. At the beginning of the semester the curriculum was centered on the power of words and context and one of the original focuses of the class was to define racism. The original focus had to be tailored because of the filtering concerns with the laptops.

**Approved Procedures Associated With Panel Discussions**

25. The school has a specific policy that requires approval for outside panelists to come in and speak in the classroom. It is referred to as the Community Resource Persons Policy. (See Exhibit 7). The school also has a specific policy when addressing controversial subject matter in the classroom and it is referred to as Teaching About Controversial Issues. (See Exhibit 7).

26. The Community Resource policy provides that a teacher who invites someone to a class as part of an instructional plan, "shall consult the principal/head of upper school who should obtain permission from the Superintendent or designee in advance." (*Id.*).

27. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

28. The Teaching About Controversial Issues provides that when a visitor from outside the classroom presents, they should be guided on standards of language usage that prevail in the classroom and by the standards of scholarly inquiry as defined in the policy. (*Id.*).

29. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

30. After being shown a copy of the policy, Mr. Dua advised that he does not believe that the project, "the n word versus cracker" is controversial but understands that, "some may think it is but I don't". (Interview of Mr. Dua).

**Selection and Participation of the Participants**

31. Those who participated on January 10, 2019 included Superintendent Salim, School Committee members Ms. Dexter and Mr. Kimbrough, Ms. Milner<sup>2</sup> and Ms. Roughton and Mr. Smith from the Information Technology Department.

32. The students chose to invite the panelists based on the earlier discussion among the School Committee, Superintendent Salim and Principal Smith involving the filters on the school issued laptops and the concern that students were being deprived of education because of the filters. (Interview of Mr. Dua).

33. In addition, the two invitees from the Information Technology Department were selected to provide the students with a better understanding of how words are filtered, who determines what words should be censored and why the words are filtered. (*Id.*).

**Panel Preparatory Discussions, Meeting and Materials**

34. Prior to the panelists arriving at his classroom on January 10, 2019, aside from the email inviting them to participate with a copy of the assignment attached, Mr. Dua did not conduct any preparatory discussions or meetings. (Interview of Mr. Dua).

35. When the panelists arrived for the panel discussion, Mr. Dua greeted them and asked them if they had any questions and there were, in fact, no questions by them. (*Id.*).

36. No guidelines were given to the speakers on what they could or could not say. (*Id.*)

---

<sup>2</sup> Ms. Milner came to classroom to observe as she is the Dean of Curriculum for the history department.

Student Preparatory Discussion, Assignments and Material

37. Each student was provided a copy of "Reclaiming N\*gger and C\*\*\*\*er: Defining Racial Context for Cambridge and America" as part of their assignment. This consisted of a 42-page packet defining Mr. Dua's expectation. [REDACTED].

38. Specifically, the students were directed to work in groups and to compile a 10 to 12 page portfolio report that would be submitted online. [REDACTED]

39. The class was also required to prepare a documentary at the conclusion of the project. [REDACTED]

40. The packet included 18 articles/documents relating to the assignment. [REDACTED]

41. In preparation for the presentation with the panelists on January 10, 2019, the students prepared specific questions and Mr. Dua reviewed them before the panel arrived. He made sure that all of the questions were relevant and appropriate. (Interview of Mr. Dua).

42. Mr. Dua also advised the students that he expected appropriate behavior and defined his expectations for them during the panel discussion. (*Id.*).

43. He instructed them not to yell over each other or over the speakers when they were addressing the class. (*Id.*).

[REDACTED]

44. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

45. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

46. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

//

47.

48.

49.

50.

51.

Review of the Immediate and Subsequent Follow Up Actions Taken by the  
School and District Adults in Response to the n-word Being Used in Context  
With Related School District and School Committee Policy

52. After the panel discussion, Mr. Dua sent an email to the panelist thanking them for participating. (See Exhibit 8).

53. In response, Ms. Dexter sent Mr. Dua an email stating in part, "I feel bad if I caused harm to students or adult guests or you by pronouncing the n-word. Ignorant of me. Will know better going forward." (*Id.*).

54. The following week Ms. Dexter met with Mr. Dua and then she met with the class. (Interviews of Mr. Dua and Ms. Dexter).

55. On January 30, 2019 Superintendent Salim sent a district wide email informing members of the district about the incident. No one was identified by name or by position. (See Exhibit 10).

56. After the email was sent by Superintendent Salim, the School Committee met and there was a motion passed in February to conduct an investigation, and a new motion was made in April to instead conduct an educational programmatic review of the January 10, 2019 panel discussion that occurred at CRLS. (See Exhibits 11 and 12).

57. There are three policies that apply to the panel discussion. They include Community Resource Persons, Teaching About Controversial Issues and the Acceptable Use. (See Exhibit 7).

58. [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED] the School Committee may want to consider sending this as part of the policies that are sent to teachers that they sign off on each year.

59. Further, a modification to the policy to include specific examples of what may be deemed controversial could assist in providing guidance to the teachers on when this policy should be applied. Also, efforts should be made ensure that teachers address the expectations for the discussion prior to a presentation involving a controversial subject.

60. Next, the School Committee may consider attaching to the Community Resource Person policy a form for the superintendent to sign that includes a summary of the subject matter that the individual will be addressing.

61. The School Committee may also want to consider implementing the following:

- a. create a complaint form for students to file when issues of concern arise in the academic setting as they may differ from the safety concerns that an incident report is used to report;
- b. make the existing mediation program more widely available so that it can be accessed by members of the school community;
- c. although filtering and removal of filters is addressed in the Acceptable Use Policy, the School Committee may consider creating a detailed policy addressing when words can be removed from the filtering protections and designate a specific administrator responsible for authorizing which words can be removed from the list of filtered words. Further, although the words that are filtered are copyright protected, an analysis of the words that are filtered should be considered to determine if it accurately reflects the School Committee's curriculum as opposed to that decided by Securely.

/s/Regina M. Ryan

Regina M. Ryan

EXHIBIT 1  
*REDACTED*

EXHIBIT 2  
*REDACTED*

EXHIBIT 3  
*REDACTED*

EXHIBIT 4  
*REDACTED*

EXHIBIT 5  
*REDACTED*

EXHIBIT 6  
*REDACTED*

## EXHIBIT 7(a)

File: IJNDB

## **ACCEPTABLE USE POLICY**

It is the policy of the Cambridge Public Schools that all technology used for the purpose of electronic communication, including without limitation, technology used to access the Cambridge Public Schools' network, information systems and data, the Internet and all electronic devices issued to staff and/or students by the Cambridge Public Schools (such as computers, telephones, etc.) and all peripheral devices for printing, storing, archiving, duplicating and receiving information regardless of location (hereinafter referred to collectively as ("Computer Network and Electronic Devices")) will be used in a responsible, legal and ethical manner.

The Cambridge Public Schools Computer Network and Electronic Devices are established for a limited educational purpose, and have not been established as a public access service or a public forum. The Cambridge Public Schools has the right to place restrictions on the use of the Computer Network and Electronic Devices it issues, and to require users to abide by system rules and School Committee policies, including but not limited to, the Cambridge Public Schools' Non-Discrimination Policy and Prohibition Against Sexual Harassment and the Cambridge Public Schools' Anti-Bullying Policy and Bullying Prevention and Intervention Plan and to protect the confidentiality of student record information and personnel record information.

While there are many valuable resources on the Internet, there also are many sites that can be considered inappropriate for students and serve no educational value. All individuals using the Internet must use the Computer Network and Electronic Devices responsibly to ensure it is only used for educational purposes, and must be consistent with the academic activities of the Cambridge Public Schools and will be under the supervision of Cambridge Public School staff. By using the Cambridge Public Schools networked information resources, both student and adult users are agreeing to accept this policy.

Use of the Cambridge Public Schools Computer Network and Electronic Devices, including without limitation networked information resources, for any illegal or commercial activities is prohibited.

The Cambridge Public Schools uses a filtering system designed to prevent access to educationally inappropriate sites, including those that contain material that is obscene, pornographic or harmful to minors. However, it is important to understand that no solution is perfect and the Cambridge Public Schools cannot guarantee that students might not access an inappropriate site. It is the student's responsibility to report any inappropriate site to a teacher and return to the educational topic assigned.

Teachers, administrators and other school personnel who are using the Internet as part of their teaching may call the Cambridge Public Schools Information, Communication and Technology Services (ICTS) department to request that a specific site be blocked or unblocked. Such decisions will be made by those responsible for monitoring the CPS filtering system in consultation with appropriate school personnel.

Use of the Cambridge Public Schools' Computer Network and Electronic Devices, including Internet access and e-mail, and other electronic devices (such as cell phones and/or PDAs) is a **PRIVILEGE** and not a right. *It is important for all Cambridge Public Schools employees, students and the parents/guardians of students to understand that refusal to sign the Acknowledgement of Receipt of the Acceptable Use Policy and/or any violation of the Cambridge Public Schools Acceptable Use Policy may result in the loss of computer, Internet, computer network, other electronic devices and/or e-mail privileges, and/or disciplinary action, and/or prosecution under state and federal law.*

The Cambridge Public Schools makes no warranties of any kind, whether expressed or implied, for the services it is providing. The Cambridge Public Schools will not be responsible for any damage you suffer including but not limited to, loss of data, interruption of service, delays, non-deliveries, or mis-deliveries caused by any reason. The Cambridge Public Schools is not responsible for the accuracy or quality of the information obtained through or stored on the network, and use of any such information is at your own risk. The Cambridge Public Schools will not be responsible for financial obligations arising through the use of the Computer Network and Electronic Devices.

It is the policy of the Cambridge School Committee and the Cambridge Public Schools that all transmission of electronic communications and storage of all information is subject to this Acceptable Use Policy, as applicable. All electronic information transmitted by, received from or stored is considered property of the Cambridge Public Schools and/or Cambridge School Committee, as applicable, and is subject to random, suspicionless monitoring, archiving and retrieval. It is important for all Cambridge Public School employees, students and parents/guardians of students to understand that there is no reasonable expectation of privacy with respect to the use of Cambridge Public Schools Computer Network and Electronic Devices, including without limitation, Internet access and email, and that there is no reasonable expectation of privacy with respect to the content of electronic communications made to or from the Cambridge Public Schools Computer Network and Electronic Devices, including Internet access and email no matter whose electronic communications equipment is used. The Cambridge Public Schools and Cambridge School Committee can and will monitor and investigate the use of email files, computers, hard drives and other electronic communications files, systems, devices and platforms regardless of whether accessed in school, in work or remotely if linked directly to the school district services.

Responsible network users will not use the Cambridge Public Schools Computer Network and Electronic Devices, including without limitation Internet access and e-mail:

- (a) for commercial purposes of any kind
- (b) for political lobbying, although users may use the system to communicate with representatives and to express his/her opinion on political issues
- (c) for illegal or criminal activities

- (d) for posting, disclosing or otherwise disseminating personal contact information about themselves or other people, including name, address, telephone, school or work address, without the prior permission of a school administrator, and the prior written permission of the individual whose personal contact information is to be posted
  - (e) for posting, disclosing or otherwise disseminating student record information without the prior permission of a school administrator, and the prior written permission of the student's parent/guardian unless such disclosure or dissemination is permitted by Massachusetts student record regulations
  - (f) for posting or otherwise disseminating a message that was sent to them privately without permission of the person who sent the message. This provision does not prohibit a user from promptly disclosing to a teacher or school administrator any message they receive that is inappropriate or makes them feel unsafe
  - (g) to threaten, humiliate, bully, harass, intimidate or send offensive information to another person or about another person
  - (h) for posting chain letters, engaging in spamming or engaging in any other inappropriate form of communication over the computer network
  - (i) for posting, disclosing or otherwise disseminating personnel record information without prior permission of a school administrator unless such disclosure or dissemination is permitted by federal or state law
  - (j) for viewing, possessing, posting, disclosing, sending, sharing or otherwise disseminating sexually explicit digital pictures, text messages, emails or other material of a sexual nature on any computer, cell phone or other electronic device regardless of whether federal or state child pornography law is violated
  - (k) for activities which disrupt the educational environment
  - (l) for unethical activities, such as cheating on assignments or tests or engaging in plagiarism
  - (m) for activities that invade the privacy of others
- for personal use; in other words, the Cambridge Public Schools' Computer Network and Electronic Devices should only be used for business and/or school purposes
- (n) to engage in any other conduct which violates any Cambridge Public Schools' policy and/or the provisions of the Cambridge Public Schools Rights and Responsibilities Handbook or school-based rules in any way

- (p) to permit students to interact with any websites that require input of personal or student identifiable information (such as name, address, telephone number, email address, etc.) unless the use of such website has been approved by the Cambridge Public Schools Information, Communication and Technology Services Department.
- (q) to violate the provisions of M.G.L.c. 71, §37O, including its provisions of regarding bullying, cyberbullying and retaliation.

Responsible network users will:

- (a) never reveal personal information about any user, such as address, telephone number, credit card number, social security number, unless express written permission is granted; and student users will never agree to meet with someone they meet on-line without a parent/guardian's approval
- (b) notify a system administrator of any security problems he/she identifies on the Computer Network and Electronic Devices
- (c) be responsible for the use of the Computer Network and Electronic Devices and account(s) at all times and never divulge his/her password(s) for any device or account to anyone
- (d) recognize that there is no privacy in the contents of e-mail, data or personal files on the Computer Network and Electronic Devices or any part thereof, and that all electronic devices and the Computer Network and Electronic Devices are subject to archiving, routine maintenance, access and monitoring of messages and files may be accessed in appropriate circumstances
- (e) promptly disclose to a teacher or school administrator any website that they locate or receive that is inappropriate or makes them feel unsafe
- (f) not attempt to gain unauthorized access to the Cambridge Public Schools Computer Network and Electronic Devices or any other computer network or go beyond the user's authorized access, make deliberate or malicious attempts to disrupt the Computer Network and Electronic Devices or destroy data by spreading computer viruses or by any other means, or otherwise vandalize, tamper with, destroy or interfere with the Computer Network and Electronic Devices, with programs, data, files or any other electronic information or devices or attempt to vandalize, tamper with, destroy or interfere with the Computer Network or Electronic Devices, with programs, data, files or any other electronic information or devices
- (g) honor the legal rights of software producers, network providers, copyright and license agreements

- (h) not use the system to access material that is profane or obscene (i.e., pornography), that advocates illegal acts, that advocates violence or discrimination toward other people (i.e., hate literature), or that is illegal (i.e., gambling)
- (i) comply with the policies of the Cambridge Public School Committee and Cambridge Public Schools, including without limitation, its Non-Discrimination Policy and Prohibition Against Sexual Harassment, Non-Tolerance of Hate Crimes Policy and Anti-Bullying Policy and Bullying Prevention and Intervention Plan in connection with the use of the Computer Network and Electronic Devices, including without limitation, the computer system and email
- (j) use the same level of care, judgment and professionalism in communicating on the Computer Network and Electronic Devices, including without limitation, the computer system and email as they would for other written communications of the school department, including without limitation those on school department or individual school letterhead
- (k) report any incidents or receipt of threats, humiliation, bullying, cyberbullying, retaliation, harassment, intimidation or offensive communications (whether via email, text message, social networking site or otherwise) in accordance with the provisions of the Cambridge Public Schools' Non-Discrimination Policy and Prohibition Against Sexual Harassment and the Cambridge Public Schools' Anti-Bullying Policy and Bullying Prevention and Intervention Plan
- (l) when posting material in a distance learning course, ensure that the posted material is made available only for students officially enrolled in the course for which the transmission is made, whether such transmission of digital information is a distance education course or a supplement to a live course; ensure reasonable measures are implemented to prevent retention of works longer than the class session and prevent unauthorized dissemination of materials (i.e., use passwords, user and location authentication through Internet protocol checking, content timeouts, print disabling, and disabling the cut and paste tool), provide clear notice to students that the work is protected by copyright and only posted material that is lawfully made, acquired and part of a systematic mediated instructional activities for the class under the control or supervision of the instructor, used in a manner analogous to performances or displays in a live classroom and the amount of material used must be comparable to the amount used in a live classroom setting and not post any digital educational works.
- (m) ensure students are educated about appropriate online behavior, including interacting with other individuals on social networking sites, chatrooms and cyberbullying awareness and response

- (n) follow all Cambridge School Committee policies, Cambridge Public School guidelines as well as any additional guidelines established by classroom teachers when publishing work on-line
- (o) not attempt to gain unauthorized access to the data, work, files, folders or any other electronic information of any other user of the Cambridge Public Schools Computer Network and Electronic Devices or any other computer network or ; make deliberate or malicious attempts to disrupt, destroy, vandalize, tamper with or interfere with the Computer Network and Electronic Devices, with data, work, files, folders or any other electronic information of any other user of the Cambridge Public Schools Computer Network and Electronic Devices or any other computer network

*Adopted: September 6, 2011*

## EXHIBIT 7(b)

File: IJOB

### COMMUNITY RESOURCE PERSONS

Human resources are those individuals or groups who are invited into the schools to present supplementary information and ideas to the classroom course of study. The classroom use of resource persons from the community can be an invaluable educational instrument. Like field trips, resource speakers can help to eliminate artificial barriers which may exist between school and community. These experiences also afford students the opportunity to benefit from community viewpoints. A resource person should not be indiscriminately selected, but rather should be invited to participate in the class or school program when there exists an actual need for his special contributions. Care should be taken in selecting these speakers so that they are individuals who respect diversity in thinking and varying views and who are not attempting to inappropriately influence points of view.

A teacher who wishes to invite someone to a class as part of the instructional plan shall consult the principal/head of upper school who shall obtain permission from the Superintendent or designee in advance. The School Committee's policies on teaching about controversial issues and CORI checks shall be observed, and teachers shall bear in mind that teaching and advocacy are two different concepts; one-sided advocacy shall be avoided.

Approval of qualified and competent resource persons shall not be reasonably withheld. In no circumstances should anyone else be allowed to give instruction or address students of the Cambridge Public Schools, unless the Superintendent or designee has given express written approval.

*Adopted: September 16, 2014*

## EXHIBIT 7(c)

**CAMBRIDGE PUBLIC SCHOOLS**  
**ELECTRONIC DEVICE USER AGREEMENT**  
**FOR ELECTRONIC DEVICES LOANED TO STUDENTS**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Student Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Grade

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
Student ID Number

\_\_\_\_\_  
Parent/Guardian Name

I hereby acknowledge that I am being issued and have received a Cambridge Public Schools' Electronic Device and below listed accessories and peripherals, more specifically described as follows: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
(hereinafter collectively referred to as the "Electronic Device"). I acknowledge that the Electronic Device is being provided to me for educational purposes only and that the Electronic Device is the property of the Cambridge Public Schools, remains the property of the Cambridge Public Schools, and is being loaned to me while I am enrolled as a student in the Cambridge Public Schools. I acknowledge and understand that the Cambridge Public Schools reserves the right to inspect the Electronic Device at any time, search any files stored on the Electronic Device, and that all information stored on the Electronic Device is subject to disclosure under the state public records laws and regulations, except for information that may be exempt from disclosure, such as those documents protected under federal and state student record laws and regulations. I also understand that I will need to return the Electronic Device to the school for maintenance and inspection upon the request of the school.

More specifically, I agree to the following guidelines for the care, protection and maintenance of the Electronic Device:

1. I will know where my assigned Electronic Device is at all times and will keep my Electronic Device with me at all times unless it is safely secured. I will never leave my Electronic Device unattended. I understand that I am expected to store my Electronic Device in suitable areas in order to keep the Electronic Device in good working order and to prevent damage due to water, dust, and temperature changes, including extreme heat and cold, and to exercise the duty of care that is expected of me for the preservation of Cambridge Public Schools property and to also prevent the loss, theft, damage or destruction of the Electronic Device, and that I will maintain and return the Electronic Device in the same condition in which it was loaned.
2. I will keep my passwords private and secure. I will immediately notify the school administration if I feel that my password is no longer private and secure.
3. I will never loan my assigned Electronic Device to anyone.

4. I understand that in order to meet the requirements of the federal Children's Internet Protection Act (CIPA), all of my Internet activity is, in accordance with the Cambridge Public Schools Acceptable Use Policy, and filtered. I understand that the filtering of Internet activity on my assigned Electronic Device occurs whether in use at school or off of school grounds.
5. I understand that in order to ensure the security and the proper functioning of my assigned Electronic Device, that my assigned Electronic Device has security device monitoring installed on it that logs all device activity and that the Cambridge Public Schools reserves the right to monitor device activity.
6. I will keep food and beverages away from my assigned Electronic Device since these items may cause damage to it.
7. I will not mark, draw, write or place stickers or decals on the Electronic Device.
8. I will not disassemble or attempt any repairs, modifications, updates or alterations on any part of my assigned Electronic Device (this will void the Electronic Device's warranty) in any way. I also will not reformat the Electronic Device, tamper with its security settings, or change its operating system or install any software on the Electronic Device. Additionally, I will not to use the Electronic Device to download software, music or other programs or items over the Internet, unless specifically authorized to do so by the CPS Information, Communications and Technology Services (ICTS) Department and the school administrator.
9. If damage or destruction occurs, including, but not limited to, scratches, cracks or dents, I will promptly report the damage or destruction to the CRLS Tech Center and will immediately return the Electronic Device to school administration if it is need of a repair.
10. In the case of theft, vandalism, or loss of the Electronic Device, I will promptly notify my Learning Community Office.
11. I will follow the provisions of the Cambridge Public Schools Acceptable Use Policy, Software Code of Ethics and Rights and Responsibilities Handbook as well as any school-based rules. I understand that inappropriate behavior that does not comply with the provisions of the Acceptable Use Policy, Software Code of Ethics, Rights and Responsibilities Handbook and/or school-based rules may lead to disciplinary action, including but not limited to, suspension or revocation of privileges, suspension or expulsion from school and/or possible criminal prosecution.
12. I will adhere to all applicable copyright and software license agreements that forbid downloading of media and software that has not been legally acquired.

13. I will not engage in any harassment, bullying or acts of intimidation (including, without limitation, bullying and/or cyber-bullying) in an attempt to harm other people using my assigned Electronic Device or any other electronic device.
14. I will return the assigned Electronic Device to my school administrator (or designee) if requested to do so. If I withdraw, am expelled, or terminate enrollment at my school for any reason, I will return the assigned Electronic Device to my school administrator (or designee) on my last day of enrollment at the school.
15. I acknowledge that the current value of the Electronic Device is \_\_\_\_\_. In that in the event of the loss, theft, damage or destruction of the Electronic Device, whether intentionally or due to negligence, I acknowledge and agree that I will be responsible for reimbursing the Cambridge Public Schools for the costs associated with the replacement of the Electronic Device and to aid the Cambridge Public Schools in collecting any necessary monies to pay for the loss, theft, damage or destruction of the Electronic Device. I also acknowledge and agree that if I refuse and/or fail to return the Electronic Device, that I will be responsible for reimbursing the Cambridge Public Schools for the costs associated with replacement of the Electronic Device and that the Cambridge Public Schools may also initiate other appropriate proceedings to seek recovery of the electronic device and/or reimbursement for the costs associated with the replacement of the Electronic Device.
16. I also understand that the Cambridge Public Schools makes no warranties of any kind, whether expressed or implied, with respect to the Electronic Device and the services being provided. I understand that the Cambridge Public Schools will not be held responsible for any damage incurred, including loss of data, interruption of service, delays, non-deliveries and mis-deliveries. I understand that the Cambridge Public Schools will not be responsible for the accuracy or quality of information obtained through or stored on any network or the Internet and that the use of such information is at my own risk. I also understand that the Cambridge Public Schools will not be held responsible for financial obligations arising through the use of any network or the Internet, and that the Cambridge Public Schools is not responsible for any computer or electronic viruses or malware that may be transferred to or from the Student's data storage medium.

By signing below both the student and his/her parents/guardians acknowledge and agree to the terms of use as set forth in this Electronic Device User Agreement for Electronic Devices Loaned to Students as well as the provisions of the Cambridge Public Schools Acceptable Use Policy for use of Cambridge Public Schools computer and network systems, the Cambridge Public Schools Software Code of Ethics and the Cambridge Public Schools Rights and Responsibilities Handbook and any school-based rules. The student and his/her parents/guardians further acknowledge that they each have read this Electronic Device User

Agreement for Electronic Devices Loaned to Students and understand its terms, and sign it voluntarily and with full knowledge of its significance.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Student Printed Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Student Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Parent/Guardian Printed Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Parent/Guardian Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
CPSD Asset Tag #

#### **TAKING ELECTRONIC DEVICE HOME – OPT OUT**

I have read and understand the responsibilities described above and do not wish for my child to take the Electronic Device home. I further understand that should the Electronic Device be needed to complete assignments during school time he/she will be provided with access to an Electronic Device, and that if the Electronic Device is needed to complete assignments outside of school and the assignment is easily replicable in hard copy, the school will provide hard copy materials for my child to take home and/or may, at its discretion, arrange to provide access to an Electronic Device on campus outside of regular classroom hours.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Student Printed Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Student Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Parent/Guardian Printed Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Parent/Guardian Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

EXHIBIT 7(d)

File: IMB

## TEACHING ABOUT CONTROVERSIAL ISSUES/CONTROVERSIAL SPEAKERS

An important goal of the schools is to help prepare students for intelligent and conscientious participation as citizens in our democratic society. One step toward meeting this goal is to introduce students to reasoned and dispassionate approaches to the analysis of contemporary social and political issues. To insure that these issues can be examined in an atmosphere as free from emotion and prejudice as the times permit, the School Committee establishes the following guidelines for discussion of controversial issues in the schools.

### Teacher-Planned Classroom Discussions

1. Controversial issues selected by teachers for classroom discussion must relate directly to the objectives and content of courses approved by the School Committee for inclusion in the curriculum.
2. The teachers' right to introduce controversial issues in classroom presentations does not include the right of advocacy. Teachers must refrain from using their positions to express partisan points of view.
3. The approach to discussion of these issues in the classroom must be objective and scholarly with minimum emphasis on opinion and maximum emphasis on intelligent analysis.
4. Teachers must ensure that the reasoned arguments of all sides of an issue are given equal presentation and emphasis in classroom discussions.
5. Teachers may invite visitors from outside the schools to give presentations on controversial issues when the visitors offer qualifications and resources not available in the schools. All visitors are to be guided by the standards of language usage that prevail in the classrooms and by the standards of scholarly inquiry set forth above. Whenever possible, teachers who invite visitors to present one side of an issue will also invite visitors to present the other side(s).
6. In all cases teachers must obtain from the appropriate principal/head of upper school permission to invite visitors for classroom presentations. Permission must be requested at least 48 hours before the scheduled time of presentation.

### Student-Initiated Forums on Controversial Issues

Student groups may request permission to conduct forums on controversial issues in the schools. The principal/head of upper school may grant such requests under the following conditions:

1. Preparation for presentation of a forum will not cause any student or teacher to miss class and will not cause the cancellation of any class.
2. Adequate advance planning must be conducted for each forum. A request to hold a forum must be received by the principal/head of upper school at least three weeks before the scheduled date of presentation. For each request the principal/head of upper school will appoint, after consultation with the requesting student group, an adult advisory group consisting of at least two parents and two

faculty members.

3. The standards for approach to discussion, style of presentation, and use of visitors as defined above will apply to student-initiated forums.

Requests from Groups or Individuals outside the Schools



No permission will be granted non-school groups or individuals to make presentations on controversial issues in the schools during school hours. Requests for after-school or evening use will be processed in accordance with the School Committee's policy on community use of school facilities.




No permission will be granted outsiders for distribution of literature on controversial issues to students in general or to class groups.

A principal/head of upper school may grant an outside group or individual permission to post one notice of a public meeting for discussion of issues if the language of that notice conforms to the standards that prevail in the community. The principal/head of upper school will determine the appropriate bulletin board for such notices.

*Adopted: September 16, 2014*

## EXHIBIT 8

**Filters**  

**Emily Dexter** <emilydextersc@gmail.com> Thu, Jan 17, 12:16 PM   



to Kevin ▾




Kevin, thanks again for giving me the chance to at least try to connect with the students. I was impressed with their directness and lack of fear of adults, which is a testament to the education they are receiving.

If the BSU wants to pursue the filter issue, I would suggest starting by inviting me and Laurance to a BSU meeting to present to us the arguments. I haven't talked with Laurance much about it, but it sounds like he has a different view from me at this point. He is chairperson of the SC Curriculum and Achievement Subcommittee, and this might be an appropriate subcommittee within which to start these discussions. Kathleen Kelly and I are the other two members.

Again, I feel bad for the harm obviously I caused, and hope to learn from it. Please convey my regards to the students and appreciation for their time. They are an impressive group and you've obviously taught them to challenge adult authority. I have high hopes for their generation. If any would allow it, I would love to read papers from the class. Naturally, I would welcome any more conversation any of them are interested in pursuing so please feel free to share my email.

Best,  
Emily.

**Atlantic article on inequity of internet filtering**  





**Emily Dexter** <emilydextersc@gmail.com> Fri, Jan 18, 8:44 AM   

to Kevin ▾

Kevin, you may have already seen this, but I found this very powerful:

[https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2016/04/internet-filtering-hurts-kids/479907/?utm\\_source=fb&fbclid=IwAR2PYckwGkX8cF7Ua05kD41rygWlgsncwaVH8ISWL6j13h8JCcIL7L1tQ](https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2016/04/internet-filtering-hurts-kids/479907/?utm_source=fb&fbclid=IwAR2PYckwGkX8cF7Ua05kD41rygWlgsncwaVH8ISWL6j13h8JCcIL7L1tQ)

**Emily**

 **Kevin Dua** <kdua@cpsd.us> Fri, Jan 18, 7:13 PM   

to me ▾

Emily:

Thank you for sending this (along with the article link today; was helpful for students to analyze it today for their project this afternoon); much appreciative.

I'll be sure to not only forward your words on next steps (with the filter) with my students but also BSU; will definitely keep you posted in the coming weeks.

Take care.

\*

## Thank You Inbox x



← **Kevin Dua** <kdua@cpsd.us>

Thu, Jan 10, 5:04 PM



to Steve, Gina, Laurance, me, Kenneth, Tanya, Damon, Marc ▾

Hi all:

First and foremost, thank you for taking time this afternoon for participating in such an informative panel today! It definitely provided much needed content for the students to explore/finalize their project centered on race, historical context, agency, and education.

I had a few students shortly afterward expressed how appreciative they were with the shared insights (from local leaders) that weren't available to them via the printed documents they had prior with their assignment.

If moving forward (ie via my students) comes in the form of a formal school committee meeting to revisit [this], I'll be sure to ask away. I'll be sure to send you all the final product (film and report) in the coming weeks.

Thank you!

## Re: Thank You



**Emily Dexter** <emilydextersc@gmail.com>

Thu, Jan 10, 5:33 PM



to Kevin ▾

Thanks Kevin. I feel bad if I caused harm to students or adult guests or you by pronouncing the n word. Ignorant of me. Will know better going forward.

Hope to see more of your students at SC meetings! The filters is a great policy question and ultimately the decision of the SC.

Best,  
Emily.

## EXHIBIT 9

41



Kevin Dua <kdua@cpsd.us>

Thu, Jan 3, 11:08 AM



to bcc: me ▾

Hi all:

My name is Kevin Dua (history teacher at Cambridge Rindge and Latin), and on behalf of my US History 2 class, you've been invited to partake next week (Tues, 1/8 - Thurs, 1/10, from 1 - 2:30p, in RM 1604; if your schedule permits) in an interview/consult session that will support their final exam project.

Titled **RECLAIMING: Nigger v. Cracker: Educating Racial Context in/for Cambridge**, their final project research (i.e. mini-film and along a 12-page typed report/per student group) tasks students to compare/contrast how media, families, and schools view the role of racial context/language (ie slurs) in education. This semester, they've focused on how the power of words/language, has shaped our nation, post Civil War to now (via laws, protests, social media, etc).

In addition, this project is designed to explore how students' education may or may not be hindered, via the newly-1:1 issued laptops, which they discovered (while trying to do their research) blocked certain words (ie "nigger," "cracker," "honky,") but not other racial slurs. To better investigate how/why race is viewed in their education by specific persons as yourselves, your participation will be of much value.

72

## Thank You Inbox x



← **Kevin Dua** <kdua@cpsd.us>

Thu, Jan 10, 5:04 PM



to Steve, Gina, Laurance, me, Kenneth, Tanya, Damon, Marc ▾

Hi all:

First and foremost, thank you for taking time this afternoon for participating in such an informative panel today! It definitely provided much needed content for the students to explore/finalize their project centered on race, historical context, agency, and education.

I had a few students shortly afterward expressed how appreciative they were with the shared insights (from local leaders) that weren't available to them via the printed documents they had prior with their assignment.

If moving forward (ie via my students) comes in the form of a formal school committee meeting to revisit [this], I'll be sure to ask away. I'll be sure to send you all the final product (film and report) in the coming weeks.

Thank you!



# EXHIBIT 10

## Statement on Racist Language

email: "cps@cpsd.us Superintendent Salim"  
To: email: "ksalim@cpsd.us"

Wednesday, January 30, 2019 at 5:04:26 PM Eastern Standard Time

Dear CPS Community,

I am writing to share information about a discussion that took place in a CRLS classroom about racial slurs such as the N-word. Earlier this month, several elected officials and CPS administrators, including myself, were invited to participate in a classroom-based panel discussion in a CRLS History class about racial slurs, the Internet, and the filters that CPS has put on its school-issued Chromebooks and web networks. On all CPS digital devices and networks, racially charged words such as the N-word are blocked.

At one point during the discussion, one panelist, an elected official, made a point about racist language and used the full N-word instead of the common substitute, "N-word." Although said in the context of a classroom discussion, and not directed toward any student or adult present, the full pronunciation of the word was upsetting to a number of students and adults who were present or who have since heard about the incident.

The official who used the term reached out to the classroom teacher and other adults, including myself, to apologize, and visited the class the following week to apologize to the students and to hear their views.

This is a good opportunity to remind ourselves of the CPS definition of racial equity:

Racial equity means the absence of institutional and structural barriers experienced by people based on race or color that impede access, opportunities and results. CPS understands that communities of color have experienced centuries of systemic oppression, and may need more as a result of these forces. Achieving racial equity requires proactive and continuous work to dismantle systemic oppression and white privilege in our schools. CPS is committed to altering systemic power dynamics and structures in order to hear and elevate underrepresented voices and to recognize and eliminate bias.

One of the painful realities of living in our culture is that even well intended statements and actions can have a harmful impact. There are no easy answers to the question of how to respond when good



## EXHIBIT 11



## CAMBRIDGE SCHOOL COMMITTEE

(Official Minutes)

Regular Meeting

February 5, 2019

Called for 6:00 p.m. in the Dr. Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room, Cambridge Rindge and Latin School, 459 Broadway, Cambridge, for the purpose of discussing any and all business that may properly come before the Committee.

Members Present: Ms. Bowman, Ms. Dexter, Mr. Fantini, Ms. Kelly, Mr. Kimbrough, Ms. Nolan, Mayor McGovern

Also Present: Mr. Grassi, Mr. Escallon, Student School Committee Representatives

Mayor McGovern in the Chair

A quorum of the School Committee being present, the Chair called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

### 1. Public Comment:

The following individuals were heard:

Dan Monahan, Lexington Ave, #19-15, - School Schedules, negotiation is needed with the Cambridge Education Association (CEA) and they will take no position until they see some strong language representing their rights. The School Committee's job is to make sure the support and funding is in place and the families and out of school time partners agree. He spoke about block schedules and commuting back and forth from home to work. Regarding #19-28, he supports the efforts to hold people accountable on issues, and suggested that we proceed with caution and take Dr. Amante's words on norms – be open to challenging yourself with positive intent - seriously.

Tanya Augustine, Wheatland St, Somerville, #19-15, opposed to Extended Day to school schedules, has been teaching in CPS since 2002, she read a detailed narrative of her various duties, tasks and responsibilities adding that she takes classes to remain current in her science teaching career. When teachers are frustrated it takes a large toll on them, adding more time to the work day will not improve anything.

Eileen Gagnon, Tobin Math coach, #19-15, in favor of Extended Day, she read a statement on file in the School Committee office.

Erin Gutierrez, #19-15, is in favor of Extended Day, it allows more time for them to see about their students. Especially the ones that need extended time for learning

Karen Dobak, Allston Street, parent of two children, CPAC parent, #19-15 strongly supports Extended Day. Students with special needs will benefit the most, when these students are pulled out of classes, it affects them negatively. There are low expectations for children with special needs. Adding more Paraprofessionals will not fix this dynamic. There needs to be teacher training to ensure success.

Alice Cohen, Lexington Ave, Lead Teacher for Social Emotional Learning for CPS #19-15, in support of Extended Day, there is a large amount of stress this agenda item is causing. Stressed adults do not perform well, take losing your keys as an example; all you can think about is that you have lost your keys. Soon you are amped up. For teachers the day feels like living in a world of lost keys. How we get adults to function at their best is to give them more collaborative time. Using the collective wisdom in this room, we should be able to figure out a way for everyone to benefit.

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

Hitomi Abe, Community Engagement Team (CET), Western Ave, partners with CPS, #19-15, gave feedback from families regarding the Extended Day, explaining what the outreach workers do; most live in Cambridge, she made it clear this is not all families however, most support #19-15. She broke it down by nationality: a significant amount of Bangladesh families support the Extended Day and want to see the time spent on extra homework supports, and personal attention, the Arabic community wants more academic learning and SEL, and have concerns that the start time is too early, the Haitian families want to see more academic learning, SEL, and sports and have concerns about the cost for afterschool programs, among the Spanish speaking families, they hope the extra time will be used for math, science, emotional supports, religion, and mindfulness and some are concerned about afterschool costs. Black families want to know how it will support closing the achievement gap.

Jane Hershey, Rindge Ave, City Sprouts Program, #19-15, supports the Extended Day; it gives students the chance to do more Gardening science, which takes time. She is in favor of the extended day to give more time for these kinds of lessons for 45 minutes four days a week. It will mean less hurried learning time for students and breathing room for teachers to collaborate.

Councillor E. Denise Simmons, Harvard Street, in support of #19-28, for an investigation of the incident that happened and shocked many people. A number of people have approached her and are very surprised that we are not more intentional about making sure we do not let these things happen. She is greatly offended. She is not calling for condemnation, but it should be harnessed.

Ellen Semenov, Bryant Street, #19-15, supports the Extended Day proposal, she applauds the work the Superintendent has done to get feedback from the community, she does not want the afterschool program to become a homework center, and is excited about building the partnership between the Department of Human Services and CPS.

Chris Lim, Pleasant Street, Baldwin parent, #19-15, is opposed to Extended Day. He wants to get his child through a school day with a joy of learning; if the day is extended he worries that the joy will leave. The early release day one day per week will disrupt home life and it will turn great teachers into tired teachers, adding that going this far without any approval from the CEA is awkward.

Mary Goldberg, Clifton Street, she supports #19-15, Extended Day for lunch and recess. The need for recess does not end in first grade. If you grew up in the US, you will know that recess has been cut back a lot. Recess is good for our vision and exercise.

Saija Scott, supports the #19-28 Investigation motion, her class has been doing this research. She would like an investigation in order to allow all to know the whole story of what happened. She does not want there to be another opportunity for this to happen again, it can become the norm and everyone will be expected to be fine with it.

Grace Austin, #19-28, on behalf of the student body, supports this investigation motion as a stepping stone. There are concerns that this issue was not addressed immediately. The pain should be acknowledged. It was ironic that it is banned yet used while speaking about the ban. Representatives should be held accountable and should not be this ignorant as to the amount of pain it will cause. There needs to be transparency and next steps after the investigation.

Kevin Dua, History teacher and Black Student Union Advisor, supports motion #19-28, he always encourages student's voices and tries to insure they are not only integrated but also validated. The students in his class felt that their work and their voices were invalidated when the Member that happened to be White used the full word. Their space felt tainted. So far, only one point of view is looked at and their identity does not matter. Mr. Dua used the actual word in his complaint of the White Member for using the actual word.

Karen Engels, Wendall Street, spoke on #19-15, extended day, does not know whether she is for or against the proposal, she wants to make sure the process is one that does not become divisive. She doesn't really want her child in an extended day, but she realizes that teachers need more time together

but parents want more time for learning. School time is only ½ of an educators work day. They need to know what responsibility is being lightened.

Jane Donohue, Chestnut Street, CRLS parent, in support of #19-28, students have been testifying for a long time about micro and macro aggressions and racism; and this motion offers a chance for the Restorative Justice Framework to be used and is in line with the District Plan. Everyone can move forward with healing.

Former Mayor Ken Reeves, President of the Cambridge branch of the NAACP, began speaking on #19-15, the extended day, what he sees missing is any reference to the actual science of experience with prior students. What happened to the information on the success of the FMA, it must have some valuable data. On the issue of #19-28, he is interested in the facts. There are various versions of what happened. There is a letter from this one and a tape from that one. He needs to know the whole story. He directed some comments to the students of color and asked these students to turn to the NAACP for help.

Darren Korle, Calendar Street, Cambridge Community Center, #19-15, is concerned about the lack of the data collection of this proposal and is looking for the supporting data. He is asking everyone to slow down a little bit.

On a motion by Ms. Bowman, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, it was voted to close public comment.

## 2. Student School Committee Report:

Mr. Escallon reported that the students do not feel represented as it relates to motion #19-28. The article in the Cambridge Day was skewed in one direction. Dr. Salim wrote something that had nothing do with their perspective. They were not given the opportunity to tell their side of what happened.

## 3. Presentation of the Records for Approval:

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Dexter, on a voice vote, it was voted to accept the January 15, 2019 Minutes as presented.

## 4. Reconsiderations: None

## 5. Unfinished Business/Calendar:

**Motion by Mr. Kimbrough from the floor by**, that the School Committee send a letter to the high school teacher that received a threatening note and resigned because of not feeling safe. C19-018, 1/15/19 (Bowman)

Discussion followed on C19-018.

Mr. Kimbrough stated that this is an important motion, especially with what we have on the Agenda tonight. A teacher was threatened by a racist message at school. It does not feel good to let this go by without any action.

Ms. Bowman motioned, Mr. Fantini seconded, to refer C19-018 to the Superintendent and Legal Counsel. On a voice vote, Order C19-018 was referred, with Mr. Kimbrough voting Nay.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, the Rules were suspended to bring item #19-28 forward for discussion.

**#19-28, Motion by Ms. Bowman**, whereas the Cambridge School Committee is committed to supporting an educational environment that affirms learning for all students; and Whereas the City of Cambridge Rules of the School Committee Addendum Committee Norms states, it is the School Committee's responsibility to set the tone for the entire school system, and the Committee will

50

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

make every effort to promote a positive image for our school system, and the Committee will operate transparently and respectfully to maintain confidentiality and respect the Open Meeting laws; and Whereas it was brought to the attention of the School Committee by students and CPD staff that there was an incident on January 10, 2019, in a classroom involving a School Committee Member using language that was reported to have made a number of students uncomfortable which called into question the core norms of the School Committee; and

Whereas there have been discussions regarding this incident within CPD, yet there has been no formal investigative process regarding the incident and the circumstances surrounding it; and

Whereas the School Committee is the legislative body of the Cambridge Public School District and is the only entity within the district to move such a process of investigation forward regarding an incident between a School Committee Member and students; therefore, be it

Resolved that the Cambridge School Committee authorize the Human Resource Department to do an investigation that follows protocols and procedures outlined in section III, IV, V of the Non-Discrimination policy, and be it further

Resolved that the School Committee determine next steps based on the report and take appropriate actions regarding the findings; and be it further

Resolved that the School Committee works with the Disruptive Equity Education Project (DEEP), who currently consults with CPD and the City of Cambridge on equity and dismantling systemic oppression and racism, to give recommendations to the School Committee, educators and students regarding the incident that took place on January 10th, 2019.

Discussion followed on #19-28.

Ms. Bowman stated that she brought this motion forward to hear the facts. It happened two weeks before she heard about it. The students have been complaining that we do not listen to them. She feels it is important to listen to the voices of our students. We hold the district and the educators to a certain standard and this motion is to hold ourselves (School Committee) to the same standards that we hold the staff to. She mentioned that she reached out to the Member before writing the motion; this motion is not a surprise to the Member.

Mayor McGovern read a statement (on file in the School Committee office), adding that he feels awful about what happened. He supports the motion by Ms. Bowman and suggested that the Governance Sub-Committee needs to create something to guide us in our Rules.

Vice Chair Kelly thanked Ms. Bowman for bringing this forward. She suggested bringing someone in from the outside may be good for investigative purposes. She thanked Mr. Antonio Escallon for his comments, it is important to know how the students feel. She agrees the School Committee has moved too slowly, it makes the students feel more vulnerable. The impacts on those that were present, who know the whole story, have the upper hand; the Committee does not have the whole story. Vice Chair Kelly is interested in knowing all of what happened to restore normalcy to those affected.

Ms. Nolan stated that she is in favor of an investigation to understand the whole context. She read an excerpt of an email from Janet Moses in support of Committee Member Dexter (on file in the School Committee office). She also read a letter from Bob Moses in support of Emily Dexter (on file in the School Committee office). Ms. Nolan makes it clear that these are not her words, but rather a matter of public record; she wanted to make sure these two letters were heard. In her own words, she feels we need to make sure we are open to hearing the acknowledgement of hurt and we also have to make sure to be open and acknowledge the apology whether butchered or not. We need to be open to discussing and disagreeing without being judged.

Mr. Grassi voiced his support of motion #19-28 because he believes the students deserve the respect and accountability provided by this motion. It is an opportunity for reflection and education and a long term lesson for CPS and the community.

Mr. Fantini stated he supports #19-28 and that it speaks to one Member and to all Members. Student voice is important. When they use their voice, we have to listen to them.

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

Ms. Bowman reiterated that motion #19-28 is to gather all of the facts so that we can do the required due diligence and hold all of ourselves accountable and move forward. She has no intention to make the Member a villain. Ms. Bowman made it clear she was not happy with her colleague's choice of reading letters that were, in her opinion, inappropriate and tone deaf.

Mayor McGovern wants to know who is going to do the investigation. The Human Resources Department does not have the authority to evaluate the controversial activity of an elected official. The Chair suggested the School Committee hire an outside person to investigate it. He referenced how the Cambridge Police Department handled an incident with a Harvard Law student of color in a police confrontation.

On a motion by Mayor McGovern, seconded by Ms. Bowman, to amend the language from the *Human Resources Department to an outside entity*, on a voice vote, with Committee Member Dexter voting PRESENT, the amendment was adopted: Resolved that the Cambridge School Committee authorize *an outside entity* do an investigation that follows protocols and procedures...

Mr. Kimbrough motioned an amendment to the third paragraph, referencing the work of author Randall Kennedy, stating there are more than a few ways to use the N word. It can be quoted, Mr. Kimbrough used the actual word to quote the name of a book, adding it can also be used with the power and history of the word itself to oppress someone. He was there on January 10<sup>th</sup>, when Committee Member Dexter quoted the word and there is huge difference between the two.

Mr. Kimbrough motioned, seconded by Ms. Nolan, to amend the third paragraph to change the language from *using to quoting* language that made.... On the following, roll call, the amendment failed of adoption: Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman NAY; Ms. Dexter PRESENT; Mr. Fantini NAY; Ms. Kelly NAY; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Mayor McGovern NAY.

Committee Member Dexter stated she supports the motion and read a statement of her actions and her sorrow (on file in the School Committee office).

On a motion by Ms. Bowman, seconded by Mr. Fantini, on a voice vote, with Committee Member voting PRESENT, item #19-28 as amended was adopted: whereas the Cambridge School Committee is committed to supporting an educational environment that affirms learning for all students; and Whereas the City of Cambridge Rules of the School Committee Addendum Committee Norms states, it is the School Committee's responsibility to set the tone for the entire school system, and the Committee will make every effort to promote a positive image for our school system, and the Committee will operate transparently and respectfully to maintain confidentiality and respect the Open Meeting laws; and Whereas it was brought to the attention of the School Committee by students and CPSD staff that there was an incident on January 10, 2019, in a classroom involving a School Committee Member using language that was reported to have made a number of students uncomfortable which called into question the core norms of the School Committee; and Whereas there have been discussions regarding this incident within CPSD, yet there has been no formal investigative process regarding the incident and the circumstances surrounding it; and Whereas the School Committee is the legislative body of the Cambridge Public School District and is the only entity within the district to move such a process of investigation forward regarding an incident between a School Committee Member and students; therefore, be it Resolved that the Cambridge School Committee authorize *an outside entity* to do an investigation that follows protocols and procedures outlined in section III, IV, V of the Non- Discrimination policy, and be it further Resolved that the School Committee determine next steps based on the report and take appropriate actions regarding the findings; and be it further

Resolved that the School Committee works with the Disruptive Equity Education Project (DEEP), who currently consults with CPSD and the City of Cambridge on equity and dismantling systemic oppression and racism, to give recommendations to the School Committee, educators and students regarding the incident that took place on January 10th, 2019.

The Chair declared a five minute recess at 7:55 p.m. The time for recess having expired, the Chair reconvened the meeting at 8:00 p.m. and returned to the regular order of business.

**6. Awaiting Reports: None**

**7. Superintendent's Agenda:**

**7a. Presentations: Improving School Schedules to Advance Equity.....Kenneth N. Salim,  
Superintendent of Schools  
CPS Principals**

Dr. Salim walked the Members through the presentation. The Principals gave very informative remarks and shared positive details that enhanced the presentation (on file in the School Committee office, and online located on the School Committee webpage with the Agenda, Notice and Video for the night).

Some of the questions, comments and concerns on the presentation included:

Ms. Nolan is curious about the one hour early release as opposed to the 6 ½ hours every day.

Dr. Salim explained that they looked at different models. There may be no early release days; consistency would be easier to plan for. They cannot depend on a system that all Educators cannot participate in.

Mr. Grassi appreciates the intent to concentrate on more learning time. He also supports the suggestions for the transition times, it is hard to get around depending on where your next class is. Community Meetings are 15 or 20 minutes, which is a great opportunity to see your classmates but it is rushed. Later start times will go a long way for students that are not morning people and it may be worth considering. Club participation is usually in the mornings, and a later start time could increase club membership.

Ms. Bowman wants to hear from the two models of extended day. She also wants to know what other districts with shorter school days are doing.

Mayor McGovern stated that in therapeutic schools, the system worked consistently with an early release day every Wednesday. On that day, they shared information and looked at the data.

Morse School Principal Chad Leith stated that they have Professional Development on early release days. The week works well and the days fly by.

Committee Member Dexter stated the timeline slide requires two votes for a policy change. This is a first reading and then it will come back again for a second reading. On the second vote she suggested that the Members authorize bringing it to collective bargaining in order to try to implement it.

Dr. Salim stated that the district and the negotiating team will benefit from questions. It is not only about authorization to move forward, but also to figure out compensation and distribution of professional time.

Committee Member Dexter suggested that it is brought back to the community also.

Mr. Kimbrough does not want the families of color to be left out of the conversations on this issue. What families of color may have to give up is probably more than what middle income and White families will have to give up by extending the school day by 45 minutes.

Ms. Bowman asked for clarification on what happens after it goes to the first reading, then the second reading. The negotiating process may change the recommendations of the two prior votes.

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

Mayor McGovern explained this is a step in the process on its way to bargaining with the intention to keep things pretty much the same as they appear tonight by the time the negotiating and bargaining are completed.

Ms. Nolan thinks this can be an exciting opportunity for us based on the Theory of Action, quality improves the use of time, quantity and access.

Mayor McGovern spoke on the either or situation, of extending or adding more teachers. He feels it should be the and situation by doing both. He also wants to make sure we reach out to the vulnerable people and make sure they are brought into the conversations.

Vice Chair Kelly stated that it is valuable to have heterogeneous classrooms as a way of building true community in our schools.

Committee Member Dexter emphasized that she is concerned about cost; transportation is huge and she is unclear about where this money will come from and also asked for a transportation model on a single start time and on a single end time. The sample being 8:15 a.m. and 3:10 p.m.

Ms. Nolan commented that she has done the research and recognizes that extended time should not all be academic it should also include recess.

The Chair worries about passing an expense to parents that cannot afford to have a half day every week. The burden may be too much. He also wonders how we can say we want to do add time and we don't know what the time will be used for. He would rather take a year of implementation and a clear picture of the time spent.

The meeting returned to the presentation. Dr. Salim spoke about staffing and time. These two issues do not address the fragmented schedules of some students, and it doesn't address many other issues. The original early release proposal was one hour, forty five minutes and that has been changed to one hour to lessen the impact to families. The presentation ended with no additional discussion.

#### 7b. CPS District Plan:

#### 7c. Consent Agenda:

Ms. Bowman moved, seconded by Ms. Nolan, to bring the Superintendent's Agenda forward for discussion and adoption.

Mayor McGovern removed 19-15. Mr. Fantini removed 19-16. Ms. Nolan removed 19-20 and 19-21. On the following roll call vote, items #19-17, #19-18, #19-19, #19-22, to #19-26 were adopted: Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Mr. Mayor YEA.

**#19-17, Special Needs Contracts for Day and Residential Program Services not Available from the Cambridge School Department**, that the School Committee award contracts to the institutions as detailed in the list in amounts not to exceed the shown rates, having been approved by the Operational Services Division of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget and/or Grant Fund Budget.

	#	Amount
Day Program Tuition Contracts	4	\$158,942.28
Residential Program Tuition Contracts	0	
45 Day Program Contracts	0	
Total	4	\$158,942.28

**#19-18, Contract Award**, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for Medicaid Reimbursement Claiming Services, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

Public Consulting Group, 148 State Street, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor, Boston, for the period July 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019, in the amount of \$97,750.00.

**#19-19, Contract Award**, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for interactive hardware, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:  
CCS Presentation Systems, 132 Northeastern Blvd., Nashua, NH, for the period February 8, 2019 to June 30, 2020, in the amount of \$50,000.00.

**#19-22, Approval of Gifts to Cambridge Public Schools**, that the School Committee accept and approve the following gifts and receipts as described.  
An in-kind donation made from an individual donor of an Alto Saxophone for the Visual and Performing Arts Department.

1. A gift of \$800.00 made to Vassal Lane Upper School by Phillips Brooks House Association as thanks for hosting summer camp.
2. A gift of \$600 made to CRLS by Harvard University as thanks for hosting an instructional rounds group from Harvard Graduate School of Education.
3. A gift of \$1,500.00 made to Vassal Lane Upper School by Biogen Foundation as a prize for the seventh grade winning second place in a Science Competition.
4. A gift of \$1,000 made to CRLS by the Laura A. Piasecki Charitable Trust.

**#19-23, Grant Award**, that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award in the amount and for the period indicated:

FY19 Massachusetts Cultural Council STARRS Project/Grant SC19894, in the amount of \$13,800.00 for the period February 23, 2019 to June 30, 2019.

**Description:** This year the MCC grants will support residency cultural series at the Amigos (\$5,000 for Dance in the Schools); Cambridgeport (\$4,200 for Underground Railroad Theatre); Baldwin (\$1,800 for Town Meeting/Freedom Trail Foundation); and Rindge Ave Upper School (\$2,800 for the Art of Biomimicry with Kyle Browne).

**#19-24, Grant Award**, that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award in the amount and for the period indicated:

Emergency impact Aid for Homeless Students Project/Grant SC19155, in the amount of \$875.00 for the period February 28, 2019 to August 31, 2019.

**Description:** This grant will be used to provide winter clothing and public transportation for students displaced to our district from Puerto Rico and the USVI as a result of hurricanes.

**#19-25, Grant Award**, that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award below in the amount and for the period indicated:

MIT Project/Grant SC19154, in the amount of \$500.00 for the period January 28, 2019 to June 30, 2019.

**Description:** This grant will be used in conjunction with a grant from the IBM Corporation to purchase a 3D printer for the Kennedy Longfellow computer Lab which will support the Ed Tech Curriculum on design thinking and modeling.

**#19-26, Grant Award**, that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award below in the amount and for the period indicated:

Lesley University/Biogen Foundation STAR Initiative Project/Grant SC19159, in the amount of \$50,000.00 for the period December 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019.

**Description:** A sub-award from Lesley University.

## **8. Non-Consent Agenda:**

55

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

**#19-15, Approval of Proposal to Improve School Schedules to Advance Equity**, that the School Committee approve the proposal to improve school schedules to advance equity (first reading).

Discussion followed on **#19-15**.

Mr. Fantini stated he is not in favor of **#19-15**. It has taken up a lot of discussion, and has caused a lot of dissention in our schools. He asked for a roll call in order to be noted as voting NAY.

Ms. Nolan indicated it is only a first reading, suggested having conversations to move it forward. On the following roll call vote, **#19-15** was referred to a second reading: Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter PRESENT; Mr. Fantini NAY; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Mr. Mayor YEA.

**#19-16, Authorization for the Superintendent to Submit to the Massachusetts School Building Authority the Statement of Interest Form** dated February 15, 2019 for the Morse School Building Located at 40 Granite Street. Recommendation: That in accordance with the requirements of the Massachusetts School Building Authority the School Committee enter an order containing the following resolution:

Resolved: Having convened in an open meeting on February 5, 2019, the Cambridge School Committee of Cambridge, Massachusetts, in accordance with its charter, by-laws, and ordinances, has voted to authorize the Superintendent to submit to the Massachusetts School Building Authority the Statement of Interest Form no later than February 15, 2019 for the Morse School located at 40 Granite Street, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138, which describes and explains the following deficiencies and the priority category for which an application may be submitted to the Massachusetts School Building Authority in the future: The funds are sought to be used for the replacement of the building's roof. The Granite Street building's roof is more than twenty-three years old and has multiple failures. This project falls under priority category number 5, which is for the replacement, renovation, or modernization of school facility systems, such as roofs, windows, boilers, heating and ventilation systems, to increase energy conservation and decrease energy related costs in a school facility, as determined in the judgment of the Authority. The Cambridge School Committee hereby further specifically acknowledges that by submitting this Statement of Interest Form, the Massachusetts School Building Authority in no way guarantees the acceptance of the approval of an application, the awarding of a grant or any other funding commitment from the Massachusetts School Building Authority, or commits the City of Cambridge to filing an application for funding with the Massachusetts School Building Authority.

Discussion followed on **#19-16**.

It was stated that once the School Committee votes tonight, item **#19-16** will be put on the City Council Agenda for approval before it goes to the Building Authority. On the following roll call vote, item **#19-16** was adopted: Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Mr. Mayor YEA.

On a motion from Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, it was voted to suspend the Rules for the purpose of reconsideration of the foregoing vote. The Rules having been suspended for the purpose stated; a motion to reconsider the foregoing vote, hoping the same would not prevail, on a unanimous voice vote, failed of adoption.

**#19-20, Contract Award**, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for Mold Remediation and Pipe Insulation Services, funds to be provided from the Revolving Fund, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:  
Lothrop Companies, 30 Winter Street, Malden, for the period February 8, 2019 to June 30, 2019, in the amount of \$35,000.00.

**#19-21, Contract Award**, that the School Committee award a contract to the following vendor for Mold Remediation and Pipe Insulation Services, funds to be provided from the Revolving Fund, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:  
24 Restore, 10 Church Street, South Easton, for the period February 8, 2019 to June 30, 2019, in the amount of \$30,000.00.

56

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

Discussion followed on #19-20 and #19-21.

Mr. Maloney stated that the air quality is fine at the Baldwin, Peabody and the Morse. There are high mold readings and high water intrusion in the walls at the Baldwin. They will remove some of the walls during the February break and hopefully that will clear up the issue.

Ms. Nolan asked for clarification if there was a separate issue of mold last year that had to be fixed. Mr. Maloney stated that it is all part of the same problem.

**9. School Committee Agenda (Policy Matters/Notifications/Requests for Information):**

Ms. Bowman moved, seconded by Mr. Kimbrough, to bring forward all items for discussion and adoption.

Ms. Nolan pulled #19-27

**#19-27, Motion by Mr. Fantini**, that the School Committee authorize the Superintendent to mail to all eighth grade families the attached brochure that is used by our SOLVED partner, The Medford Vocational Technical High School, subject to any revisions the Superintendent deems necessary.

Discussion followed on #19-27.

Ms. Nolan asked for clarification on whether the mailing is going to be distributed through backpacks along with using the postal system.

It was indicated that both would be preferable. On a voice vote, item #19-27 was adopted.

**#19-29**, The Report of the January 22, 2019 Budget Sub-Committee (Committee of the Whole) Hearing was accepted as presented:

**Budget Sub-Committee Hearing  
School Committee Conference Room  
January 22, 2019  
3:30 – 5:30 p.m.**

Called for the purpose of a Public Hearing inviting the input of Educators and Members of the Community regarding the FY20 School Department Budget Priorities.

Members Present: Mayor McGovern (ABSENT), Ms. Bowman (ABSENT), Ms. Dexter, Mr. Fantini, Ms. Nolan (ABSENT), Ms. Kelly (ABSENT), and Mr. Kimbrough (ABSENT), Ms. Nolan (ABSENT).

Also Present: Dr. Salim, Dr. Turk, Dr. Adams, Ms. MacDonald, Ms. Spinner, Ms. Allen, Mr. DeJesus, Mr. Monahan, Ms. Liss

Mr. Fantini in the chair, a quorum of the Sub-Committee being present Mr. Fantini called the meeting to order at 3:52 PM and read the call of the meeting.

Public Comment:

Dan Monahan, CEA President: Lexington Ave and Parent of CRLS Junior. There needs to be greater transparency and equity with regard to elementary staffing and class size information which was requested from Administration but is incomplete. Allocation of funds to co-create a K-12 Equity Action Network to figure out ways to release teachers from some of their work without sacrificing the supports our scholars need. We need to better respond to reported incidents and build our capacity with proactive and reactive restorative practices. (comments on file in School Committee office)

Francis Fennell 5<sup>th</sup> Grade Student at Baldwin: She is not in favor of extending the school day. (comments on file in SC office)

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

Jen Healy, Nicole Golding, Susan Comstock and Jessica Karwowski representing the Haggerty staff. Priorities are staffing in grades JK-2 they need a second adult with 20 kids in the classroom. Co-teaching to Close the achievement gap, a full time Social Worker, two Building substitutes and additional staffing during less structured times especially in AM with free breakfasts being offered, continue to have access to 2 part-time Interventionists. Maintain the computer lab and library so teachers can use it, fix/replace equipment that is not working well in the building; chrome books, Teacher's computers and old smart boards and projectors. Our Technology person is only ½ time.

Fabiane Noronha, King Open School OLA teacher: Create dual language education, need a 2<sup>nd</sup> Kindergarten in the new building, she has 20 kids age 4-6 in her classroom, 10 are JK's and it is hard to teach two languages when kids are at different levels. New books and a book room, we have no Portuguese books, teachers are using their free time to translate books and glue them together.

Ana Travasso, King Open School: 5<sup>th</sup> grade OLA teacher, We start with a full class but because of attrition it is hard for kids to join the class and have the language. Her class is extremely small which is not a good environment because there needs to be a lot of conversation in the class for kids. She wants an additional Kindergarten classroom in the new building which would allow them to pass a full class up to the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> grade. When they reach 5<sup>th</sup> grade they love each other. Amigos and King have two Kindergartens so it is an equity thing. They anticipate more of a demand for the Ola Program.

Mary Elizabeth Cranton, CSUS Interventionist and Parent; She supports full time Family Liaisons. She read a statement from Allison Skully another staff member who supports full-time Literacy Interventionists and grade level Adjustment Counselors. If students don't get support they disengage in school over time and Teachers cannot be mental health clinicians. (on file in SC office)

Betsy Preval, CSUS 6<sup>th</sup> grade ELA teacher: Shares Allison Skully's views that they need more staffing including Counselors, full time Literacy Interventionist, Family Liaisons, Special Educators and Paraprofessionals. They need Lunch Aides because their funds for Lunch Aides were used to hire Mr. Soares. Our two Guidance Counselors are doing lunch duty and are needed elsewhere to support scholars. There should be a Counselor for grades 6, 7 and 8. Specialists and World Language Teachers need in class supports because they are IEP heavy. Behaviors escalate in the arts courses and need more support staff. Her co-teacher is only in her classroom 40% of the week. Administration just approved for a .4 Literacy Interventionist, where are we going to get a dedicated, qualified person? Where is the relationship building for this? She invited everyone to come visit her classroom and see what it's like on a daily basis.

Jen Mason Stott, King Open School Library: Advocating for elementary and Upper School libraries and Paraprofessional staffing. She started as a Paraprofessional and worked her way up. Paraprofessionals are needed because they build trust and provide academic support for students. Out of the 12 elementary schools only four have Paraprofessional support. There is a lot of maintenance of the library materials that the Paraprofessionals can take care of. She read examples of what the Librarians that have Paraprofessionals do. The 3<sup>rd</sup> graders need handholding to get on the computers and learn. Tobin is unique because of the Montessori Model but she is requesting equity for all libraries and funding for Paraprofessionals.

Caitlin O'Donnell, Teacher at Fletcher Maynard Academy: She shared an excel spreadsheet with Ms. Dexter (on file in SC office) on class size numbers in general education classes. Only four Principals supplied data to her including the Cambridgeport, Fletcher Maynard Academy, Graham & Parks and Tobin Montessori. In general education grades 1 through 5 there is a huge discrepancy in the number of Paraprofessionals to Students ratios, which is shocking and alarming, and ranges from, 1-86 and 1 for 22 students. That is not equity. Some schools have Interns helping them. We need the data and need to look at the best staffed school in the district.

Rose Levine, 5<sup>th</sup> grade Teacher at Graham & Parks: She wants the budget to prioritize equitable access and outcome in all schools regarding staffing. Early grades are essential for the gaps between the students of color and their white peers. At her school there is a Paraprofessional or Intern in each classroom with the lead Teacher. Every classroom in the District should have two adults. She has a

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

Paraprofessional in her classroom, which gives her the flexibility to work with some students while the other adult works with another group of students. Provide funding because we need adults to build relationships with the students and they need educators that look like them.

Robyn Towner, Special Educator at King School: Many Special needs students need individualized instruction. More Paraprofessional's are crucial but they are not Teachers and cannot supply services as detailed in a student's IEP unless they are specifically hired by OSS. Additional Special Educators are needed for adequate and equitable student support and to co-teach at grade level. Some Middle Schools have two Special Educators per grade level while in elementary schools Special Educators have 2-3 grade levels. The K-2 Special Educator can have as many as ten classrooms that they need to work with. Typical caseloads for elementary Special Educators is 20+ students. Fragmented work with students is not dependable support for students. 4-6 children in groups is not specialized instruction for each student. Fund additional Special Educators at the elementary level. (on file in SC office).

Ross Benson, CRLS Math Teacher: The district enrollment has increased and the district doesn't know who lives in Cambridge and the High School doesn't look proactively if students live here. Tax dollars should be used for kids that actually live in Cambridge.

Matt Dunkel, King Open Parent and VLUS Teacher: He supports the Equity Action Network because racism and inequity are impacting our young people and is corrosive in our District (on file in SC office). We need a comprehensive network based approach to build connection, solidarity and mutual support across initiatives. Equity work takes place outside of school hours and limits our impact. We need additional resources to fund an Equity Action Network to build Equity across the District.

Ed Walker, CRLS Guidance Counselor: He Supports funding the CEA recommendation for a strong Equity Action Network of educators that allows building based and district wide implementation particularly regarding racial issues, sharing best practices, building common purpose, increasing solidarity and ensuring collective impact that empowers every school, employee and student in a way that this district is capable of. (on file in SC Office)

Michelle Currier and Lilly Martinez Baldwin Teachers: Teachers feel they aren't being heard. It is divisive and she echoes what others have spoken about. They polled the whole school (64 people) and the majority don't want an extended day. Their staff said they need additional staffing in classrooms, more adults in classroom, parking at school, smaller class size, behavior support, social emotional curriculum across the district, pay teachers to tutor after school, more innovative curriculum instruction, more Special Education Teachers with general Education Teachers. Interns are being used for recess duty and they are not ready and should not be considered staff.

Karen Engels, Teacher: She is in favor of funding the Equity Action Team, increase staff in classroom, are Interns needed as staffing? Teachers and Librarians need full time Paraprofessionals, improve the co-teaching collaboration time, with the social emotional issues need more Guidance Counselors and Interventionists. The Elementary Program Review said we don't need more staffing but more time. We need to be included in the conversations.

Superintendent Salim announced that there will be two more public hearings on the Proposed Budget.

Ms. Dexter thanked everyone for coming and apologized for starting late.  
Motion to adjourn by Ms. Nolan, second by Mayor McGovern, the meeting ended at 5:03PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Terry Gist  
Confidential Secretary to the School Committee

Documents on file in the School Committee Office from the following;  
Dan Monahan

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

Frances Fennell  
Haggerty School Staff (Jen Healy, Nicole Golding, Susan Comstock, Jessica Karwowski)  
Allison Skully  
Robyn Towner  
Matt Dunkel  
Ed Walker  
Rose Levine

#### **10. Resolutions (letters of congratulations, letters of condolence):**

**#19-30, Motion by Mr. Fantini**, that the School Committee congratulate Amy Short, Assistant Director for Library Media Services, as a recipient of the 2019 Massachusetts School Library Association Peggy Hallisey Lifetime Achievement Award. This award celebrates Amy's exemplary commitment to the service of students and 21st century learning and to the advancement of school libraries. She is a fierce advocate for our school libraries and their central role in our students' rigorous, joyful, culturally responsive learning experiences. Amy will be honored on Sunday, March 31 during the MSLA Awards Banquet as part of the MSLA Annual Conference, "School Libraries are for Everyone", and That the Executive Secretary is requested to forward a suitable congratulatory letter on behalf of the entire School Committee.

SOURCE: Massachusetts School Library Association

#### **11. Announcements:**

Mayor McGovern announced the following:

Cambridge Digs DEEP, Thursday, February 7, 2019 from 5:30-8:00 p.m.

Open Mic Night, Thursday, February 28, 2019 6:00 to 8:00 pm.

CPS has won the opportunity for a chance to submit a proposal for the NSBA spring conference in Philadelphia, PN, CPS accepted and will be presenting issues such as out of school time, how we do our budget process

#### **12. Late Orders:** On a unanimous voice vote, it was voted to adopt the following:

**Motion by Mr. Fantini**, that the School Committee congratulate Mary Grassi for being recognized by the Reading Recovery Council of North America as its "2019 Excellence in literacy Leadership Award" which is presented by the Reading Recovery teacher leaders. Awards will be presented on Sunday, February 10, during the 2019 National Reading Recovery K-6 Literacy Conference opening session at the Greater Columbus Convention Center.

During her 40 year-career in Cambridge, Mary Grassi has worked as a Substitute Teacher, Classroom, Teacher, Title I Reading Specialist, and Title I Curriculum Coordinator. She has been integral to the development and growth of Reading Recovery in the Cambridge area for the past 25 years. As site coordinator for five school districts, her efforts have helped create a strong model that allows for layers of intervention in response to literacy needs of all children

Mary connects with other Title I Directors across the state, working to ensure financing is available to support training and ongoing professional development for Reading Recovery teaching and implementation. She is a founding member of the Reading Recovery Council of Massachusetts and serves in a variety of roles at the district and state level, receiving numerous awards in her tenure. "Mary Grassi is a tireless advocate for Reading Recovery," said Teacher Leader Karen Tili who, along with Teacher Leader Maureen Bobbin, nominated Mary. "She knows that having access to Reading Recovery is essential for the children who need it most, and she works to maintain and extend implementation. She sits on the networking committee of the state council, focusing on recruiting new districts and increasing awareness across the state."

SOURCE: Reading Recovery Council of North America

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

January 9, 2019

[https://readingrecovery.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/01/Literacy\\_Leadership\\_Award-2019.pdf](https://readingrecovery.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/01/Literacy_Leadership_Award-2019.pdf)

**Motion by Mayor McGovern**, a resolution on the passing of Ms. Muriel W. Turk.

**--IN SCHOOL COMMITTEE--**

**February 22, 2019**

**WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK, mother of Dr. Carolyn Turk, Deputy Superintendent of the Cambridge Public Schools, passed away peacefully on January 22, 2019 at the age of 100 and*

**WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK was born in Boston, Massachusetts but moved to Cambridge in 1949 where she raised her family and*

**WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK was an active member serving multiple roles at her church, The Church of St. Augustine and St. Martin, as well as being a member of the Aristo Club of Boston, an organization of Black professional women who studied and taught Black history and awarded scholarships to Black children and*

**WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK was a long-time member of the Cambridge Unity Committee, who's primary focus was to advise the City Manager on issues of race and class and*

**WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK was a public school teacher and active member of the Girl Scouts in Boston and touched the lives of many young people and*

**WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK always had a bright and loving smile and possessed a quick wit right up until her passing and*

**WHEREAS:** *MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK will be missed by many, NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT*

**RESOLVED:** *that the Members of the Cambridge School Committee go on record expressing its heartfelt condolences to Dr. Carolyn Turk on the passing of her mother, MURIEL WELLINGTON TURK and BE IT FURTHER*

**RESOLVED:** *that the Executive Secretary of the School Committee send a copy of this resolution to Dr. Carolyn Turk.*

*A true copy:*

*Attest:*

**Dosha E. Beard**

**Executive Secretary to the School Committee**

**Revised 2019 Schedule of Budget Meetings** (on file in the School Committee office).

Mr. Fantini explained that the changes are the dates that are in red.

61

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

February 5, 2019

**13. Communications from City Officers: None**

**Distributed Back-up Documents** (copies on file in the School Committee office):

- Agenda
- Revised 2019 Schedule of Budget Meetings
- Improving School Schedules to Advance Equity PowerPoint presentation

**Statements from Public Comment** (copies on file in the School Committee office)

- |                                   |                                                   |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|
| ✓ Ross Benson, CRLS Math Teacher, | #19-15, Extended Day                              |
| ✓ Dan Monahan, CEA President,     | #19-15 and #19-28, Extended Day and Investigation |
| ✓ Jane Donohue, Parent,           | #19-28, Investigation                             |
| ✓ Mayor McGovern,                 | #19-28, Investigation                             |
| ✓ Councillor E. Denise Simmons,   | #19-28, Investigation                             |
| ✓ Hope Kelley,                    | #19-15, Extended Day                              |
| ✓ Rebecca Coyne,                  | #19-15 Extended Day                               |
| ✓ Tanya Augustine,                | #19-15 Extended Day                               |
| ✓ Jane Hirschi, City Sprouts,     | #19-15, Extended Day                              |
| ✓ Ellen Semonoff, DHSP,           | #19-15, Extended Day                              |

**E-Mail communications** (copies on file in the School Committee office)

- |                             |                       |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------|
| ❖ Archy LaSalle,            | #19-15, Extended Day  |
| ❖ Martin Benoit,            | #19-15, Extended Day  |
| ❖ Rebecca Coyne,            | #19-15 Extended Day   |
| ❖ Liz Phipps-Soeiro,        | #19-28, Investigation |
| ❖ Rebecca S. Lester,        | #19-28 Investigation  |
| ❖ Councillor Alanna Mallon, | #19-28, Investigation |
| ❖ Grace Austin,             | #19-28, Investigation |
| ❖ Janet Moses               | #19-28, Investigation |
| ❖ Bob Moses,                | #19-28, Investigation |

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, it was voted to adjourn at 9:50 p.m.

Attest:

*Dosha E. Beard*

Dosha Beard  
Executive Secretary

## EXHIBIT 12



**CAMBRIDGE  
SCHOOL COMMITTEE**

(Official Minutes)

**Regular Meeting**

**April 2, 2019**

Called for 6:00 p.m. in the Dr. Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room, Cambridge Rindge and Latin School, 459 Broadway, Cambridge, for the purpose of discussing any and all business that may properly come before the Committee.

Members Present: Ms. Bowman, Ms. Dexter, Mr. Fantini, Ms. Kelly, Mr. Kimbrough, Ms. Nolan,  
Mayor McGovern

Also Present: Mr. Grassi, Mr. Escallon, Student School Committee Representatives

Mayor McGovern in the Chair

A quorum of the School Committee being present, the Chair called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

**1. Public Comment:**

The following individuals were heard:

- Anil Mundra, Plympton St., Parent, thanked Dr. Salim and School Committee Members for hearing their plea for the 2<sup>nd</sup> OLA kindergarten classroom and responding. He hopes for a vibrant program to reflect the diversity of Cambridge.
- Dan Monahan, Lexington St., CEA President, is happy about the budget and has questions on how to close gaps, the Nellie Mae Grant, in regards to #19-70 on the educational review, this should be on the purview of the administration, in regards to #19-69 on the AV, he feels we should not act unless all people are represented.
- Betsy Preval, Spring St., CSUS Teacher, re the Budget, is looking for a third counselor, many general education scholars are suffering from anxiety and depression, many families do not have health insurance outside of the school system and they are asking for help. Depression among 16 to 17 year olds has jumped to 69% and the suicide rate has climbed to 56%.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, the rules were suspended to allow Betsy Preval to finish her comments.

- Elissa Spellman, Belmont, MA, Executive Director of Breakthrough Boston, appreciates the many ways that we support the program. She gave the demographics and explained the program. She explained what they do after school and what happened last year with the Design Lab. They are asking for more funding.
- Samia Afrose, Newtowne Ct., Breakthrough student, explained that Breakthrough has helped her through the middle grades, CRLS and has been entirely supported by Breakthrough. She has been in AP classes thanks to this program with tutoring etc.
- Abdul Dawson, Parker St., Breakthrough parent of a child with autism, thanks to Breakthrough his son has been able to set goals for himself and responds to taking care of himself as a lifestyle rather than a chore. He advocates for himself, his grades have risen tremendously. He comes home from school excited and engages with his family about Breakthrough.

On a motion by Ms. Nolan, seconded by Mr. Fantini to allow Allisa Spellman Exec. Dir. Of Breakthrough to read a statement by someone else.

- Katie Lynch, Weymouth MA, G&P Special Needs Teacher, spoke before and came back to reiterate the need for more than one teacher in one classroom. They try to work with the general

64

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

education teachers, however the inclusion part will be impaired if there is only one teacher in the class.

On a motion by Ms. Bowman, seconded by Ms. Nolan, it was voted to close public comment.

## **2. Student School Committee Report:**

Mr. Grassi reported on the following: Student Government is running a month of philanthropy, the cause is for planned parenthood. Coming up are the talent show, the prom, and Nest Fest. The e cigarette buy back has gone to the City Council.

Mr. Escallon reported on the following: The Environmental Action Club is sponsoring environmental week, asking for all clubs to concentrate on educating their members on what is happening in the environment and around the globe. There are environmental art pictures on the ceiling tiles in the hallways.

## **3. Presentation of the Records for Approval:**

On a motion by Ms Nolan, seconded by Ms. Kelly, it was voted to accept the following Minutes as presented:

- Special Meeting, March 12, 2019 Budget Workshop
- Regular Meeting, March 19, 2019

## **4. Reconsiderations: None**

## **5. Unfinished Business/Calendar:**

On a motion by Mayor McGovern, seconded by Mr. Fantini, it was moved to suspend the Rules to bring forward motion **#19-69** by Vice-Chair Kelly. On a voice vote, the Rules were suspended for the reason stated.

**#19-69, Motion by Vice Chair Kelly**, that the AV Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee will reconvene with Emily Dexter as Chair, Kathleen Kelly and Patty Nolan as members on Tuesday, April 2, 2019. The AV Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee will share its recommendations with the full School Committee on Tuesday, June 18, 2019.

With item **#19-69** before the Committee of the Whole, on a voice vote, **#19-69** was adopted for the purpose of organization. With the reorganization of the AV Sub-Committee officially in place, on a motion by Vice Chair Kelly, seconded by Ms. Bowman, **#19-51** was referred to the AV Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee.

**#19-51 Joint Motion by Committee Member Dexter, Vice Chair Kelly, and Ms. Nolan**, that whereas the Cambridge Rindge and Latin School administration has been engaged in a two-year process, supported by a School Committee Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee, to revise the high school Attendance Violation (AV) Policy toward greater equity; and

Whereas the School Committee values data-informed policy-making and comprehensive communication of policies;

The AV Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee, chaired by Emily Dexter with members Kathleen Kelly and Patty Nolan, requests that a draft of the new policy, to be implemented beginning in September, 2019, be presented, as a First Reading, to the School Committee no later than May 21, 2019, along with a communication plan to ensure that all students, faculty, and administrators are aware of the new policy and that there is faculty "buy-in"; and

The Committee requests data from the Fall, 2018, semester showing the following attendance data in the aggregate and disaggregated by: lunch status, race/ethnicity, gender, disability status, and ELL status: 1) number of students absent and tardy; 2) number of students absent and tardy without an excuse (Earned AV); 3) number of students "buying out" their Earned AV's; and 4) number of students whose grades were reduced due to an Assigned AV. These data are requested by May 7, 2019. C19-063, 3-19-19 (McGovern)

The Chair returned the meeting to the Regular Order of Business.

65

**6. Awaiting Reports:**

**#19-52, Joint Motion by Ms. Nolan and Mr. Kimbrough**, whereas the School Committee worked to raise the level of instruction for all students through the Level Up initiative at CRLS; and Whereas a recent Globe project on valedictorians documented a sobering and critically important question of whether high schools are preparing students for success; and Whereas the recent report The Opportunity Myth by The New Teachers Project found that despite 71% of students in a national representative sample of audited classes met classroom expectations and succeeded on assignments, only 17% of those assignments were on grade level when evaluated; and Whereas both the Valedictorian Project and The New Teachers Project identified the need for high expectations and intentional focus on rigorous curriculum, instruction and assignments as key to delivering on the promise of success in college and life; and Whereas there were gaps by racial subgroups in performance on common assessment; and Whereas nearly 1 in 3 CRLS students indicated that teachers do not have very high expectations of them; Therefore, the School Committee directs the Administration to have an external audit of the Level Up ELA classes, by an organization with expertise in this specific area, done in conjunction with the School Committee as a joint effort to ensure that the initiative is as successful as possible.

No discussion, **#19-52** was passed over.

**7. Superintendent's Agenda:**

**7a. Presentations:** None

**7b. CPS District Plan:** None

**7c. Consent Agenda:**

Mr. Kimbrough moved; seconded by Vice Chair Kelly, on a voice vote, it was voted, to bring the Superintendent's Agenda forward for discussion and adoption.

The Chair moved suspension of the Rules, seconded by Mr. Fantini, to bring Ms. Nolan's budget related motions **#19-71**, **#19-72** and **#19-73** from the School Committee Agenda forward to the Superintendent's Agenda for consideration and adoption. On a voice vote, the Rules were suspended for the reason stated.

**#19-72, Motion by Ms. Nolan**, that as part of the budget for SY 2019-20, the Administration is directed to add a second Kindergarten to the OLA Program, to ensure that educationally and fiscally the Program can be more fully enrolled, per discussions on having a sustainable program long term.

Ms. Nolan motioned, seconded by Mr. Fantini, permission to withdraw **#19-72** from the Agenda. On voice vote of unanimous consent, **#19-72** was withdrawn.

The Chair returned the meeting to the Regular Order of Business.

Mayor McGovern removed **19-57**. Ms. Nolan removed **19-58**. On the following roll call vote, items **19-59 through 19-65** were adopted: Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mayor McGovern YEA.

**Recommendation #19-59**, Special Needs Contracts for Day and Residential Program Services not Available from the Cambridge School Department, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee award contracts to the institutions as detailed in the list in amounts not to exceed the shown rates, having been approved by the Operational Services Division of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget and/or Grant Fund Budget.

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

	<u>#</u>	<u>Amount</u>
Day Program Tuition Contracts	0	
Residential Program Tuition Contracts	1	\$26,052.39
45 Day Program Contracts	0	
Total	1	<u>\$26,052.39</u>

**Recommendation #19-60**, approval of Gift of \$300.00, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee accept and approve a gift of \$300.00 to the Haggerty School from the Arbella Insurance foundation for a bus for a field trip to the Boston Symphony Orchestra Youth Concert

**Recommendation #19-61, Grant Award**, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award in the amount and for the period indicated:  
FY19 Special Education IDEA Allocation (SC19605) increase in the amount of \$17,619.00 for the period September 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019.

**Description:** The purpose of this Federal Entitlement Grant Program is to provide funds to ensure that eligible students with disabilities receive a free and appropriate public education that includes special education and related services designed to meet their individual needs. The temporary salaries line ins an offset for the Proportionate Share of services provided to private school students. The remainder will be used for out-of-district tuition for students. (Note: amount indicated is \$3,000 less than the full state allocation as a membership fee of \$3,000 to Mass Urban Project is paid directly by DESE).

**Recommendation #19-62, Grant Award**, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award in the amount and for the period indicated:  
Private Donation from Hasty Pudding (SC19775) in the amount of \$46,000.00 for the period March 19, 2019 to August 31, 2019.

**Description:** This grant will be used to support arts and performance field trip tickets across the district, to support CRLS exhibition space to showcase student are, and for additional equitable support for students in music and art.

**Recommendation #19-63, Grant Award**, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award in the amount and for the period indicated:  
FY19 Title IIA/Teacher Quality (SC19731) INCREASE in the amount of \$1,519.00 for the period September 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019.

**Description:** As part of a comprehensive district initiative that focuses on the preparation, training, recruitment, and retention of highly qualified educators, Title IIA funds provide teacher stipends for mentoring and professional learning, as well as conference registrations; private school staff at participating schools are also served in proportion to their school's enrollment. Temporary Salaries fund mentor stipends and curriculum writing. Other Expenses include professional development contracts for Math, and the required allocation to private schools.

**Recommendation #19-64, Grant Award**, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award in the amount and for the period indicated:  
FY19 Title I Distribution (SC19604) INCREASE in the amount of \$1,355.00 for the period September 1, 2018 to June 30, 2019.

**Description:** The FY19 Title I grant funds Intervention teachers at Kennedy Longfellow, King Open, Morse, Fletcher Maynard Academy and CSUS. These teachers provide ELA and Math intervention and targeted support to at-risk students. Temporary salaries fund after school and summer school stipends. The grant budget also provides funding for services for homeless students, professional development, parent involvement, printing and supplies, and services to eligible students in private schools.

The Increase in Title I funds of \$1,355.00 will be used to support conference registration for the Title I Director.

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

**Recommendation #19-65, FY18-19 General Fund Budget Statutory Transfers**, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee approves the following statutory transfers of appropriation within the General Fund Budget for FY2018-2019.

	<u>Statutory Coding</u>	<u>Increase/Decrease</u>
51000	Salaries, Wages & Benefits	(\$335,000.00)
52000/55000	Other Ordinary Maintenance	0
57000	Travel & Training	\$335,000.00
58000/59000	Extraordinary Expenditures	0
	Total	\$0

Mr. Fantini moved, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on a voice vote, it was voted to suspend the Rules for the purpose of reconsideration of the foregoing vote. The Rules having been suspended for the purpose stated; a motion to reconsider the foregoing vote, hoping the same would not prevail, on a voice vote, failed of adoption.

The Chair returned to the regular order business.

#### 8. Non-Consent Agenda:

**Recommendation #19-58, SY 2019-2020 Cambridge Public Schools District Calendar**, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee approve the recommendation of the Superintendent for the SY2019-2020 Cambridge Public Schools District Calendar.

Discussion followed on **#19-58**.

Ms. Nolan thanked everyone that worked on this calendar, is happy to see the important dates which include major religious and cultural holidays brought back to the calendar. On a motion by Ms. Nolan, seconded by Mr. Fantini, on a voice vote, **#19-58** was adopted.

**#19-71, Motion by Ms. Nolan**, that whereas Cambridge Public Schools seeks to have effective programs which align with the district plan; and

Whereas Breakthrough has been a partner in Cambridge working effectively to close gaps for its population of overwhelmingly low income students of color and develop a diverse pipeline of excellent teachers; and  
Whereas they requested an increase of \$20,000 in order to improve their work on improving outcomes in eight grade Math and AP/Honors enrollment;

Discussion followed on **#19-71**.

Ms. Nolan stated this is an astonishing budget, and she spoke on Breakthrough hoping that there will be money allocated to them for an additional \$20,000.00 of funding. If we justify our funding on outcomes, there is no reason not to fully fund this request. They are not scheduled to get any increase at all.

Mr. Fantini offered an amendment, seconded by Ms. Nolan, to add in motion **#19-71 that the Superintendent provide year end funding to Breakthrough and Through the 4<sup>th</sup> Wall** rather than change the budget.

Discussion continued on **#19-71**.

Ms. Bowman stated motion **#19-71** is problematic. Some partners get an increase and some do not. Partners should not be allowed to undermine the administration and the Superintendent's decisions by finding a School Committee Member to write up a motion to give the partner what the partner wants.

Ms. Kelly agreed in terms of bringing motions forward on the evening we are voting on the budget, now is not the time to have a discussion about different little pots of money. The budget is driven by the CFO and the Superintendent. There have already been enough workshops, meetings and hearings to have covered all issues. The budget presented by the Superintendent to the School Committee is in front of us tonight for a vote, not a discussion.

Ms. Nolan wants the record to show that she reached out to Breakthrough; no one at Breakthrough came to her.

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

Mr. Fantini reiterated that he does not want to mess with the Superintendent's Budget. He would rather use language from his offer to amend motion #19-71 without disturbing a balanced budget.

Mr. Kimbrough wants to know what is usually done with funds at the end of the year that have not been spent?

Ms. Spinner stated that essentially we manage to typically expect an extra balance due to salary outages, extra sick time that was not used, etc. We don't know the exact amount until payroll is posted in June. We feel comfortable to make additional payments in small nominal amounts. There is no formal process around significant extra money, we agree to transfer money to various funds, i.e. capital, district or school funds. It is hard to identify funds to spend before June 30<sup>th</sup>.

Mr. Kimbrough asked for clarification on how the School Committee as a body can decide how the extra money can be spent.

Ms. Spinner informed the assembly that by the time we know what is left over, the city's spending mechanisms have shut down for the fiscal year. At the end of the day, it depends on what happened before the school year ends. We need wiggle room to insure we do not go red.

Ms. Bowman stated she has no doubt that Breakthrough and other partners bring amazing things to the table, however, the equitable process has not been adhered to, Committee Members received the Superintendent's Adjustments to the budget 24 hours ago.

Budget Co-Chair Dexter suggested that the two Budget Co-Chairs, the Superintendent and CFO collaborate on what will go to the partners adding that the Superintendent does not know everything and it is the job of the School Committee to bring issues to the table – even if it is at the last minute. It is okay to add into or subtract from the budget that is what the process is.

Mayor McGovern asked Ms. Nolan when she reached out to Breakthrough what is the \$20,000.00 to be used for? Ms. Nolan answered that it was for 8<sup>th</sup> grade math expansion.

The Chair asked Dr. Salim if Beyond the 4<sup>th</sup> Wall and Breakthrough were the only two partners that were not funded.

The Superintendent responded that as a result of the review process for FY 2020 funding, and the requests pitted against district based priorities, the decision was made that Enroot, Cambridge Housing Authority, Breakthrough, Beyond the 4<sup>th</sup> Wall and Cambridge School Volunteers do not get funding.

The Chair suggested we look at end of year balances and send money to all of the above mentioned partners. He agreed with Budget Co-Chair Fantini that it is not a good idea to change a balanced budget.

Mr. Fantini's motion to amend Ms. Nolan's motion, #19-71 was withdrawn.

The Chair offered a substitute motion, seconded by Mr. Fantini, for Ms. Nolan's motion #19-71, **that the Superintendent examine end of the year balances to determine if there is additional funding for our community partners who are not receiving a funding allocation in the FY 2020 budget.** On a voice vote, the substitute motion for item #19-71 was adopted.

**#19-73, Motion by Ms. Nolan,** that whereas the budget includes an increase in aides as a way to address educational needs of students; and  
Whereas the bilingual immersion school model has an educational rationale for an aide allocation that has served it well over time, that in next year's budget no school has a decrease in aide allocations.

Discussion followed on #19-73.

Ms. Nolan carefully reviewed the budget and noticed that Amigos is the only school that has a decline in Aides. She made a parallel to the Tobin and the Amigos that given the nature of both programs, it was determined that their educational program is predicated on that.

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

Dr. Salim mentioned that at the last budget workshop they agreed what they do with each school are overall staffing decisions. There were other requests that the Amigos school has made, he spoke on Interventionists, full time Special Educator, and trying to hire Bilingual Educators.

Budget Co-Chair Fantini wants to know whether the Amigos can fund an aide through their SIP funds. His question was answered in the affirmative. On a voice vote, #19-73 was adopted and referred to Dr. Salim.

**Recommendation #19-57, Fiscal Year 2020 Recommended Budget**, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee receive and approve the FY2020 General Fund Budget of the Cambridge Public Schools in the following Statutory Categories:

Salaries, Wages & Fringe Benefits	\$165,758,199.00
Other Ordinary Maintenance	\$ 34,646,803.00
Travel & Training	\$ 949,300.00
Extraordinary Expenditures	\$ 425,300.00
Total	\$201,770,255.00

Dr. Salim spoke of the memo he sent on Monday, April 1, 2019 regarding the FY 2020 Budget Adjustments (on file in the School Committee office) which keeps the budget in balance. He explained his consideration of the testimonies from the budget hearings, workshops and presentations to make the adjustments, adding that he has more information on enrollments than he did when first putting the budget together, he shared specifics of the recommended adjustments in his memo. He acknowledged the Budget Sub-Committee Co-chairs for their leadership, appreciates the Committee's discussions, the tremendous partnership with the City Manager and his hardworking CFO.

Mr. Kimbrough read a portion of a book Hey Black Child by Useni Eugen Perkins that promotes positive attributes regarding Black children being able to be all they want to be. He shared portion of this book because public education is the only tool that our kids have as a trajectory to all accomplishments.

Ms. Bowman stated that she likes the Superintendent's adjustments; however, she exercised her Charter Rights and placed Superintendent's Recommendation #19-57 on the Calendar for possibly one week, in order to have a better chance to actually follow the process stating there are too many disconnects. Ms. Bowman allowed the conversation to continue.

The Mayor hopes the Members will be reasonable next week when we try to vote it again.

Vice Chair Kelly stated that we have operated an entire year without a Planning Officer and we need one. It is a critical position. She is a bit frustrated to not have the ability to pass the budget tonight.

Ms. Nolan would like to hear the rationale for a Chief Planning Officer; she does not believe there are any in other districts with so few schools.

The Superintendent explained why it took so long to present his adjustments to the proposed budget to the School Committee. Passing the budget is a key responsibility of the School Committee. No decision is taken lightly or done quickly for determining what happens to put a budget together and how the people in the district do their work. For him, it is about how those pieces fit together, how we can improve, i.e. adding 59 more positions with a vision aligned around improvement and requires coordinating staff. He does not want our vulnerable students to become too dependent on the Aides. The Math Intervention Position is an area that comes from many areas. Regarding the Chief Planning Officer, it was a .5 position so it could accommodate Dr. Likis; her support has been sorely missed. He sees it as a critically important position. He explained how many things have not been done without a Planning Officer. He will be disappointed if a vote does not take place this evening.

Mayor McGovern mentioned that he has heard a few times that this is the School Committee's budget. He clarified that the School Committee hires a Superintendent to be the educational leader of this district and it is

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

Dr. Salim's responsibility to come up with a budget to fund this district. The Chair indicated that no matter how many times the Superintendent says yes it is still not enough, this body could exercise more discipline in not looking at the budget from a deficit view.

Mr. Fantini respectfully asked Ms. Bowman to remove the Charter Right.

Ms. Bowman is open to removing the Charter Right, but she does not want to be in this situation again.

Committee Member Dexter reminded the body that she has an amendment on the floor.

Committee Member Dexter motioned; seconded by Kimbrough, to amend Superintendent's Recommendation #19-57 **that the School Committee take three positions at the admin level: Chief Planning Officer, full time Clerk to direct and greet visitors, and ½ time District Literacy Coach, the combined salaries are \$259,400.00. Those salaries can be used instead for CSUS Counselor, lead teacher for equity and for 9<sup>th</sup> grade support and the rest will go to reserve teachers.** She read a statement stating that our cost of spending per student has gone down not up and she read a statement about the process that is used every year involving taking the status quo budget and tweaking it. She indicated that the budget should be looked at from the classroom up instead of from the district down.

Ms. Nolan asked for a point of clarification. The Mayor explained that School Committee will first vote on Committee Member Dexter's amendment and then on recommendation #19-57 as amended. On the following roll call vote, the **amendment to recommendation #19-57** failed of adoption: Mr. Fantini NAY; Ms. Kelly NAY; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman NAY; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mayor McGovern NAY.

**Recommendation #19-57**, on a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Kelly, on the following roll call it was voted to adopt:

Salaries, Wages & Fringe Benefits \$165,758,199.00  
Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter NAY; Mayor McGovern YEA.

Other Ordinary Maintenance \$ 34,646,803.00  
Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough NAY; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter NAY; Mayor McGovern YEA.

Travel and Training \$ 949,300.00  
Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough NAY; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter NAY; Mayor McGovern YEA.

Extraordinary Expenditures \$ 425,300.00  
Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough NAY; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter NAY; Mayor McGovern YEA.

Total Budget \$201,770,255.00  
Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough NAY; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter NAY; Mayor McGovern YEA.

On a motion from Mr. Fantini, seconded by Mayor McGovern, on a voice vote, it was voted to suspend the Rules for the purpose of reconsideration of the foregoing vote. The Rules were suspended for the purpose stated. On the following roll call vote, a motion to reconsider the foregoing vote, failed of adoption: Mr. Fantini NAY; Ms. Kelly NAY; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman NAY; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mayor McGovern NAY. Since the motion not to reconsider prevailed, the matter will not come before the Committee again.

**9. School Committee Agenda (Policy Matters/Notifications/Requests for Information):**

Ms. Nolan moved, seconded by Ms Bowman, on a voice vote, it was voted to bring forward all items on the School Committee Agenda for discussion and adoption.

Mr. Fantini removed **#19-66, #19-67 and #19-74**. Mr. Kimbrough removed **#19-70**.

On the following roll call vote, items **#19-68, #19-69, #19-75, #19-76, #19-77** were adopted: Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mayor McGovern YEA.

**#19-66, Motion by Committee Member Dexter**, that whereas the School Committee has scheduled a Roundtable on disproportionality in Special Education for Tuesday, May 28, 2019; and Whereas this topic is of interest to members of the public who may not be able to attend the Roundtable in person;  
That the School Committee televise and livestream the Roundtable and archive a video of the Roundtable on the School Committee website.

Discussion followed on **#19-66**.

Committee Member Dexter stated that she knows there is tremendous interest on this topic and Roundtables will not be televised unless we vote to do so. She is sure there are members of the public that will not be able to attend the actual Roundtable and will appreciate being able to see the video.

Ms. Nolan wondered if this Roundtable is only on disproportionality or on all Special Education aspects. She also mentioned that it may be useful to look at the review that was done a few years ago on disproportionality in Special Education. On a voice vote, **#19-66** was adopted.

On a voice vote, it was voted that the School Committee adopt both **#19-67** and **#19-74** together and refer them both to the Superintendent to work on the implementation with the motion makers.

**#19-67, Joint Motion by Committee Member Dexter and Mr. Kimbrough**, that whereas the Cambridge Public Schools currently offer three language immersion programs and several elementary school world language programs; and  
Where there is increasing demand for these programs as well as enrollment challenges related to socioeconomic and language balance; and  
Whereas the School Committee has not comprehensively discussed issues related to its elementary world language and immersion programs in many years;  
The School Committee will hold a Roundtable discussion on CPS Elementary Immersion and World Language Programs, which will include but not be limited to the following topics:  
1) Language and SES balance in immersion schools and the related lottery formulas;  
2) Data from recent years on enrollment and lottery choices in the CPS elementary schools that offer immersion or world language education;  
3) Capacity and number of seats and classrooms in the current immersion programs;  
4) Equitable access to elementary world language and Immersion programs across the 12 elementary schools;  
5) JK-12 language pathways for students beginning their language instruction in elementary school and middle school.  
6) Language assessment and language proficiency levels attained in CPS immersion and elementary world language programs.

This Roundtable will be televised, livestreamed, and video-archived on the School Committee webpage.

**#19-74, Motion by Ms. Nolan**, that whereas the Cambridge Public Schools currently offer three language immersion programs and several elementary school world language programs; and  
Whereas world language study in early grades is educationally beneficial; and  
Whereas bilingual immersion programs have demonstrated effectiveness in closing gaps; and  
Whereas there is increasing demand for these programs as well as enrollment challenges;

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

The School Committee will hold a Roundtable discussion before the end of this school year on CPS Elementary Immersion and World Language Programs, which will seek to explore expanding such programs with a goal of equitable access to elementary world language and immersion programs across the city; Further that JK-12 language pathways for students beginning their language instruction in elementary school and middle school will be discussed.

**#19-68, Joint Motion by Mr. Fantini and Mayor McGovern**, given that the Cambridge Police Department is creating a Cadet Program beginning at age 18 primarily to support Cambridge youth to become Police Officers;

That the School Department evaluate what it would take to open a Ch. 74 Criminal Justice Program that would serve to compliment the Cadet Program. On a voice vote, **#19-68** was adopted.

**#19-70, Motion by Ms. Bowman**, that the School Committee requests that the Superintendent undertake an educational programmatic review of the January 10, 2019 panel discussion that occurred at Cambridge Rindge and Latin School and that this review be conducted by outside legal services and that it seek to address the issues detailed in the attached scope of services; and

Further, that the Superintendent bring forward to the School Committee any recommended revisions to relevant policies that he believes are warranted as a result of this programmatic review, including but not limited to, the following policies: School Departments Non-Discrimination Policy and Prohibition Against Sexual Harassment, Teaching About Controversial Issues/Controversial Speakers, and Community Resource Persons; and

Further, that the School Committee be provided with a copy of the completed report for its review and consideration of whether to take any actions with respect to the findings, including making any revisions to either School Committee policies and/or School Committee rules; and

Further, that this motion supersedes and replaces paragraphs five through seven of School Committee Order C19-033.

#### Scope of Services

##### Overview

The Cambridge Public Schools is seeking the services of an attorney to conduct a prompt and objective fact-finding review of a matter which occurred in a class at the Cambridge Rindge and Latin School (CRLS) on January 10, 2019 which involved the use of language (the n-word) during a panel discussion, and which was reported to have made a number of students uncomfortable, and has been a subject of internal and community discussion and debate as well as the subject of local press coverage.

The scope of services sought include:

- Conduct individual and/or group fact-finding interviews with parties involved, including but not limited to, students in the class, the teacher of the class; panelists; members of the Black Student Union (BSU) and student government; the Dean overseeing History classes at CRLS and others participating or attending the panel discussion in question.
- Engage in a comprehensive review of the conduct of the classroom panel discussion, including but not limited to:
  - The basis and context for the selection of the panel topic
  - Particulars relating to panel organization
  - The connection between the panel discussion topic and the class syllabus and the CRLS History department's curriculum
  - Approval procedures associated with the panel conduction
  - Selection and preparation of panel participants;
  - Panelist preparatory discussions, meetings and materials
  - Student preparatory discussions, assignments and materials
  - Review of the video recording of the panel discussion.
  - Review of the immediate and subsequent follow-up actions taken by school and district adults in response to the "n-word" being used, in context with related school district and School Committee policies.
- Prepare and submit a written report to the Cambridge Public Schools of the fact-finding review, its findings, and recommendations *by no later than June 2019*.

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

Please submit your hourly rate together with a budget to perform the above scope of services not to exceed \$9,500.00 to:

Legal Counsel  
Cambridge Public Schools  
Office of Legal Counsel  
159 Thorndike Street  
Cambridge, MA 02141

Discussion followed on **#19-70**.

Mr. Kimbrough asked for the rationale on the motion and the scope of services.

Ms. Bowman stated that in order to move forward within a statutory process, this motion was framed to obtain an allotment of resources for Ms. MacFarlane to oversee this process.

Mr. Kimbrough understands the scope of services; he is trying to further understand what it is exactly that we are looking to investigate. He has concerns as to whether or not it is the role of the School Committee to be looking at what the teachers are doing in their classes.

Ms. Bowman stated from a statutory perspective, this is taking the original motion and putting it in the framework to do the investigation described in the original motion. A colleague sought legal representation which has slowed the process down. Instead of being transparent, Things were happening behind the scenes.

Ms. Dexter stated it is quite a change and she read a statement expressing her pleasure with motion **#19-70** instead of the initial motion which was more accusatory (on file in the school committee office).

On the following roll call vote, **#19-70** was adopted: Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough NAY; Ms Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter NAY; Mayor McGovern YEA.

On a motion from Mr. Fantini, seconded by Mr. Ms. Nolan it was voted to suspend the Rules for the purpose of reconsideration of the foregoing vote. The Rules having been suspended for the purpose stated, a motion to reconsider the foregoing vote, hoping the same would not prevail, failed of adoption.

**#19-75, Motion by Ms. Bowman**, whereas the 1-1 Chromebook implementation technology program is designed to create more equality and access for CRLS students; and  
Whereas some students have challenges accessing or replacing a Chromebook if the device is lost or broken because of the replacement fee associated with the 1:1 Chromebook implementation policy; and  
Whereas creating a 1:1 Chromebook program to create equity and access is a vital component of the Cambridge Public School District Plan,  
Therefore, be it resolved that the Superintendent works with the ICTS Department and CRLS leadership to ensure the current 1:1 Chromebook policy is providing proper access for all CRLS students.

On a voice vote, **#19-75** was adopted.

**#19-76**, that the Report of the March 20 2019 Buildings and Grounds Sub-Committee be accepted as presented:

**Buildings & Grounds Sub-Committee Meeting**  
**March 20, 2019**  
**School Committee Conference Room**  
**5:30 – 6:30 p.m.**

Called for the purpose to start discussions and identify issues related to custodial services and permitting issues as well as district enrollment projections.

Present: Ms. Nolan, Chair; Ms. Bowman (~~ABSENT~~), Mr. Fantini

74

Also Present: Mr. Maloney, Ms. Spinner

The Chair called the meeting to order at 5:33 PM and read the call of the meeting.

Ms. Nolan turned the meeting over to Mr. Maloney.

Mr. Maloney stated that the custodial contract states that detail rates in buildings are \$35 and \$45 per hour. There is also past practices that dictate when a permit is needed. In January the union filed a grievance stating that they are entitled to overtime when working details. A vast number of custodial staff are already earning more than \$35-\$45 per hour. The Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA) states that they need to be paid an overtime rate (time and one half) for any hours worked over 40 hours per week, which we confirmed with outside counsel. Last year we had about 9700 hours of outside use permits that could have been billable detail hours. There is a two year look back in the law for employees to be paid overtime retroactively. There is a three year look back for intentionally not paying the overtime rate. For FY18 the average overtime hourly rate was \$41.82, next fiscal year that will increase 5%, but that doesn't include double time.

Ms. Spinner added that the Fair Labor Standards Act law says you may not negotiate a different overtime rate in a bargaining agreement. A few years ago we had the same problem with our Clerical, Liaison, Paraprofessional and IT staff who worked on service agreements after their regular 40-hour work week and we had to pay them the overtime rate retroactively for two years.

Ms. Spinner continued when we looked at the OT average for custodians the rate was lower than what the Senior's were being paid. We are going to need to change the rate to time and a half. The law doesn't say anything about double time. Our employees get double time if called back on Sundays or on holidays which is in the contract. If they use a sick day, it is not counted in the 40 hours and that would be exempt.

We are bargaining with the Custodians now and agreed to implement FLSA laws and are re-bargaining the detail section of the contract. The School Committee voted on the language and recognition of category and rates. This was put in place and we found out that things were not always done the same way in all schools. We did mention in bargaining there are some practices we have followed about when and what triggers an overtime detail to add an additional custodian on school nights (M-F) in addition to the regular workers. For example, how many people are attending and if food is being served. The cost change for the community and the School Committee Policy regarding facilities while being mindful that we need to protect our buildings. We don't want to use CPS funds to pay overtime details. We need to find a way to mitigate the impact in the hourly rate change and what we can do that triggers an extra custodian?

Ms. Nolan commented that our policy is very strong that we want the community to have access, be open, welcoming and friendly. Especially for the parent, school and community groups in the city that are aligned at the policy level and we want to be sure that happens. We need to be aware of any time we cannot trigger another custodian in the building.

Ms. Spinner added right now if there is food in the building an additional custodian is there for the entire time. Is there a way to change that so they are only there for one hour to clean up? We could tell users we are going to provide a trash barrel and if not cleaned up there will be an extra charge added after the fact. We have been very strong in community policy and it is a state law. The big issue is on Monday-Friday which we can strategize on; Saturday and Sunday is hard because there is not staff in the buildings. The Sunday rate is \$45.00 per hour so there would not be a change right now for that. Saturday will increase by \$10.00 per hour. We never resolved the issue with our youth groups and now it is significantly harder to absorb by us and them. We need to phase it in. Last year it was \$35.00 per hour and there was about \$120,000-\$130,000 that had to be absorbed in the budget. That is going to wipe out the revolving fund and is not sustainable. If users have less than 50 people and no snacks you don't need an additional person.

Mr. Maloney stated our goal with the custodians is we want this to be a neutral impact for both of us. Part of our response is looking at the tiers 3 and 4 rates that are below other communities. If you talk to the people, not the organizers of the youth leagues, the real issue is they don't want to have to collect the money from the

75

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

families which is not a valid reason. Our youth partners don't pay anything. We are looking at increasing fees for corporate leagues (basketball, volleyball) fees. We need to look at the rate structure and partner structure.

Ms. Nolan and Mr. Fantini agree if they are educational partners. Cambridge Youth Sports are different from student academic programs.

Ms. Spinner thinks the high school needs security which has no exemptions. Security staff have been paid overtime for years, it's in their contract.

Mr. Maloney added that the issue with the Safety Union is they all leave at 4:00 PM and they have a 3-hour call back, if needed.

Ms. Spinner thinks we need to staff Security differently; a person could work until 6:00 PM or hire a half time person during the evening hours and Ms. Nolan agreed.

Ms. Nolan thinks the city is in sync with us. Almost every week the city has community meetings with families in the schools.

Mr. Maloney added they don't want to make it as rigid. Sometimes at night during a meeting, he will walk the building and find graffiti and at 7:00 PM there are still teachers in their classrooms so I feel strongly that the building needs security.

Ms. Nolan mentioned that she has visited the Breakthrough Program in Boston and Somerville and the Breakthrough supervisor is an administrator and can lock the building.

Ms. Spinner stated Mr. Smith pays all fees from his budget for custodial and security staff for his night meetings. But if the Morse school has a pot luck dinner the Principal only pays for the extra custodian. Mr. Maloney added we used to have a night shift security person who worked 12 - 8 with a base salary of \$60,000-65,000 plus \$20,000 for benefits, but there were nights when nothing was going on. We are open to look at that again.

Ms. Spinner added if we're going to have a meeting the call of the meeting notice can say there is going to be an executive session during that time. Or if Ms. MacFarlane calls a strategy session, we could invite Ms. Nolan as the Chair of Buildings & Grounds.

Mr. Maloney added that the first hour would be to discuss collective bargaining strategy and the second hour would be the meeting. If we can meet 4 times by mid-May, we will know approximately what the hourly rate would be and how it will impact members.

Ms. Spinner stated once we raise the rate we won't be able to share the figures until we have an agreement. We may set a rate before the users see how they are applied. The rates need to be set by April for next year.

Ms. Nolan went on to long term enrollment.

Ms. Spinner is working with the City and Ms. MacDonald, Leigh Ann Ellis, Cliff Cook and Ellen Semenov. We put out the RFP a year ago and in September awarded the contract. UMass Donahue is the partnership organization. The focus of the study is early childhood and alongside this we need a school age population projection and enrollment projection for Cambridge Public Schools paired with a space analysis based on the models they propose. We want them to project if we made early childhood free for all. Four months ago they presented one of four population models that looked broadly at where we are and included some specific Cambridge information. Cambridge has an interesting curve that is different from surrounding communities. Cambridge has not had that baby boom bump because we have always had the universities. The models were shown but they are not ready to hand it over until we choose one. They need to do population projections by age to tell us how many 3 year olds we will have. They did not hire an outside group of demographers. We will probably get the report by the end of June. We have our own enrollment projections to 2025.

Mr. Maloney added this is to complement the Envision study. We asked the city for funds to do a study of our remaining buildings; Cambridgeport, Graham & Parks, Kennedy Longfellow, Amigos, FMA and Longfellow and make recommendations for building favorability and space. The City Manager responded that there will be no funding for big capital projects until after the Tobin Project. The buildings built in the 70's were poorly constructed. Graham & Parks may have more capacity by adding another floor. The city said to come back with the specifications and they will consider giving us some funds by next September.

Ms. Nolan asked what happened with the City possibly buying land at Alewife?

Mr. Maloney responded we don't have neighborhood schools, access to that area by bus and foot is almost impossible. We would not argue for an area where we don't have neighborhood schools. The issue would be the clean-up of the soil would cost \$50M dollars and the land would cost \$50M. All the land from Fresh Pond Parkway to Santa Maria used to be a landfill. They are going to grapple with us if there is a way to add capacity to existing buildings we could get more done for less.

Ms. Nolan suggested the city could tell a builder if you are going to build a building we want the ground floor used as a school or early childhood center. We should not tear down buildings.

Mr. Maloney added the neighbors are going to have a lot to say. Residents on Vassal Lane and Concord Ave. don't want it there.

Ms. Spinner does not think we are going to have the information soon. The RFP was sent out in June and we executed a contract in August and the work started in September. We are not where we want to be.

Ms. Nolan stated if the client wants a report quickly the contractor will move faster.

Mr. Maloney added the City Manager is the signature, not us.

Ms. Nolan if the development of the Alewife area increases 10%, that will be another school.

Ms. Spinner added our projections are really about our own experiences. We can only base it on the housing projections. Development has been pretty much the same. We have seen a 2% increase over the last decade. The question is will that change?

Mr. Fantini made a motion to adjourn at 6:36 PM seconded by Ms. Nolan.

#19-77, that the Report of the March 25 2019 Special Education and Student Supports Sub-Committee be accepted as presented.

**Special Education and Student Supports Sub-Committee Meeting**  
**March 25, 2019**  
**School Committee Conference Room**  
**4:30 – 6:30 p.m.**

Called for the purpose of discussing the District's reading Curriculum, Foundations, Multi-Tiered Student Supports, and reading interventions, including Reading Recovery.

Present: Ms. Kelly, Chair; Ms. Dexter, Mr. Kimbrough (ABSENT)

Also Present Ms. MacDonald, Ms. Grassi, Ms. Tingle, Karen Seeley, Maureen Bobbitt, Karyn Grace, Mr. Fantini, Ms. Rippey

The chair called the meeting to order at 4:32 PM and read the call of the meeting.

Ms. MacDonald gave a brief overview of the Presentation, Cambridge Public Schools Reading & Writing Curriculum (on file in the School Committee office). Ms. Kelly previously sent some questions to Ms. MacDonald that they will answer with the presentation. The team met with Jan Morgan and Ms. Spera to

prepare for this meeting. She turned the meeting over to Ms. Tingle who spoke about aligning the curriculum with the standards. Ms. Tingle stated that they are rolling out the curriculum in the 1<sup>st</sup> grade this year. The goal is to align the curriculum with the literacy standards and the district initiative of rigorous, joyful, culturally responsive standards.

There will be a curriculum to connect Social Studies and Science in the writing units. They have created this with Understanding by Design. Every unit has a time frame and use end of unit assessment with formative assessment after 4 weeks so there is an opportunity for teachers to see if students are learning so they have time to review with them. She reviewed how the students start by writing letters about what they want and thinking about who they can go to and how they can go about making changes. For example, one 1<sup>st</sup> grade student wanted more trees in the city found out they could send letters to the DPW and then someone from the DPW came and spoke to the class. Another student wrote about the homeless population and were invited to City Hall to speak about homeless people and made up packages for the homeless people. It is a way for students to care about their world.

Ms. Grassi reviewed how the curriculum aligns with the five components of reading instruction; phonics, comprehension, vocabulary, phonological awareness, and fluency. There is interactive reading where kids read aloud and model for fluency. Comprehension helps students reading and understanding. Does guided reading and asking questions make sense? Processing strategies and writing to the text is intended to understand the comprehension by writing about the reading.

Ms. Tingle added you will see that they are linked in the standards. Our priority standard is reading (a big one). They should read a grade level text. Students need to do independent reading so they can love reading and engage in their world. Reading foundations in the standards are print concepts, phonological awareness, phonics and fluency. Within the structure of the units there are systematic phonics instruction and how they work. There is daily small group reading instruction. Teachers use reading assessment to determine where students are. It allows for differentiated instruction to bring them to the next level. Students don't stay at that level for the rest of that year. Coaches and professional development support the teachers to do that. There is a link to the frameworks on the DOE website to see what the standards are composed of.

Ms. MacDonald went over the multi-tiered system of support. Some kids need additional instruction in addition to the core program. This year we re-implemented our district Multi-tiered support team. Multi-tiered intervention is a continuum of evidence based systematic practices. It is about how the district and the schools work collaboratively. Universal Design for Learning is about equitable access.

Ms. Grassi reviewed the Core Components of MTSS that were developed by a group of teachers looking at UBD frameworks. We are currently exploring additional practices. Mind Matters is being integrated with the parents. There is continuous monitoring going on and collaboration with the families for social emotional and academic supports.

Ms. MacDonald asked Ms. Bobbit and Ms. Seeley to give an overview of the Reading Recovery Program. The students work on letter recognition and compose a story of two sentences using boxes. The teacher cuts up the words of their story then the kids match up words to recognize the sounds of the words. It focuses on student strength. Right now Behind the Glass Mirror is being used at the Peabody School for teachers to watch each other. There is a sign-up sheet for anyone who wants to come visit the classroom. We are constantly measuring progress and looking at our data to see how they are progressing. The observation survey assessment is given at the beginning and end of a lesson. We also dictate sentences and the child learns to write it down. We have had been successful in the Reading Recovery Program. The 13 Study independent evaluation showed the growth rate for students who participated Reading Recovery was 131% of the national average for all first grade students.

Ms. MacDonald reviewed the priorities moving forward and that more professional development across the district. OSS is working with Dr. Adams on this. This summer the SUMMIT Program in collaboration with Mass General and MIT are going to look at a targeted literacy program for students that are currently struggling with literacy. There will be 80 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> grade students that will participate. Ms. Spera has been very instrumental in familiarizing us with working with dyslexia screeners. We are committed to the goal of all our students being proficient readers and writers.

Ms. Kelly asked Ms. MacDonald to speak more about the connection between behavior and academics on student learning.

Ms. MacDonald responded that if a child is struggling and we do not provide intervention we begin to see behavior changes. What can we do proactively to help students and support our teachers with strategies to recognize things that are good for all students when they do have issues.

Ms. Kelly feels that our district has been slow in responding to stressors for our students and wants the district to be more proactive. The frustration level where some students are not getting it and you're not, is stressful. It doesn't matter what grade level.

Ms. Dexter thanked everyone. She feels there is some misunderstanding about how we teach reading. She is concerned about 1<sup>st</sup> – 3<sup>rd</sup> grade students who are struggling with reading. Do SPED educators get different training than general education teachers? What is the difference between students on an IEP and not on an IEP?

Ms. Karyn Grace responded about the teacher training and how it is different. The colleges are only giving educators overviews not training them so the district has used Orton-Gillingham and others. B.J. Cataldo trained many people and some teachers use Project Read. We want to see data on how they are progressing. Special Educators are taking advantage of Orton Gillingham and RAVO, as a different delivery and they get more clinical training. Right now 99% of SPED elementary teachers have been trained.

Ms. Dexter asked about students who have had interventions at 1<sup>st</sup> grade and what is happening with 3<sup>rd</sup> grade? Ms. MacDonald responded that Ms. Jen Paige developed a huge dashboard for teachers to see when the schools come together and she is entering the data into School/City but we're not there yet.

Ms. Rippey said there needs to be collaboration between special education and general education teachers. How long have children with dyslexia waited to get support? Ms. Seeley and Ms. Bobbitt responded we will be screening children as early as Kindergarten to identify kids at risk for dyslexia. We have looked at structured literacy because it is cumulative and changed the intervention for our children.

Ms. Rippey has friends whose children had been diagnosed in 2<sup>nd</sup> grade but waited until 3<sup>rd</sup> or 4<sup>th</sup> grade for services. Ms. Bobbitt responded we are looking closely because many children have dyslexia and many have not.

Ms. MacDonald replied it speaks to having special educators at the table with general educators to do more diagnostic testing. Reading Recovery expects a child to make accelerated progress in a short amount of time. The recent history is different for prior history. The adoption of changing our screening system helped us pay more attention to those discrete skills because prior to that we used assessment tools.

Nathan, a 10<sup>th</sup> grade CRLS student went through this in 1<sup>st</sup> grade and it did not work for him at all. At the end of 1<sup>st</sup> grade he was placed in Reading Recovery and was diagnosed with dyslexia. I knew I was not doing as well as other students that messed me up mentally. Nothing was really done about it and I still struggled until 3<sup>rd</sup> grade. My spelling is still terrible and the lack of support he got is still affecting him in high school.

A Parent - Her son repeated 1<sup>st</sup> grade at Graham & Parks. Why are we waiting to see what the guidance is, I don't see the urgency in the District. Kids are being traumatized in the classroom. She is concerned about the 22% of kids that aren't identified. What is the harm in giving kids more than what they need and help all kids to understand how they learn rather than waiting.

Ms. Kelly would like to see screeners in pre-school. There is a 3 year old screener.

A Parent said there is an equity problem with families with limited economic resources or English is not their first language and cannot advocate for their child.

Lisa Parent of Nathan said he worked with a special educator in 3<sup>rd</sup> grade and made two years of progress in 3 months. It comes down to luck, what school you are in, the teacher you get and some kids aren't getting it.

A Parent stated It is hurry up and wait. When your child is getting worse and falling behind. A lot of parents don't realize it and the IEP teachers are out half of the time. OSS needs to be beefed up on teacher training. You don't have to wait for the state get to the crux of what it is for our kids. There are so many types of tests out there. When families register for school test them. A lot of kids are in 7<sup>th</sup>, 8<sup>th</sup>, or 9<sup>th</sup> grade that feel stupid, get depressed and go on medication. There needs to be something done in IEP meetings when the psychologist is sitting there saying no they're OK. Not all but some kids are falling thru the cracks. What is happening in those classroom? We have to fight to get kids to a point to where they are happy with themselves? As a parent we hit a wall with the teams.

Ms. Kelly responded that is for another meeting, what makes an effective IEP meeting from the parent and student point of view.

Ms. Dexter responded we have so many kids with reading problems and our staffing is not the same across the schools. Especially in 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> grade, do not we have enough people to deliver services.

Ms. Tingle added we have staff challenges; we are trying to have more inclusive practices. Students don't need to be pulled from their classroom for extra help. But sometimes kids need to be taken out of their classes to receive their services.

The Family Liaison for SPED was also diagnosed with dyslexia and had the same experience as Nathan and with the amount of resources Cambridge has we should be able to get this right.

Nathan thinks we should teach parents about supports and advertise about learning disabilities and is grateful my mom knew people to get me what I needed.

Ms. MacDonald stated that this summer the SUMMIT Program parents will be given the opportunity for students to have brain scans.

Ms. Tingle added we are working to identify kids that have reading difficulty but are not dyslexic and figuring out what we can do. We are not waiting around to service kids. Sometimes you need to try different things to make sure we are identifying them. We are at a place where we can move together to do this.

A Parent stated she has difficulty because 6 years ago we started something different. SPED PAC parents are coming in from all over. I understand culturally parents don't want to identify kids with needs. All teachers and schools across the board need to be doing the same thing. Help the teachers to identify what they need and give them support, not the Principal or the teams.

Ms. Rippey commented that six years ago Dr. Gab reached out to CPS with paper based screenings where a parent would get a letter telling them that their child is at risk of developing dyslexia but the system did not take the offer.

Nathan thinks making the teachers aware and are afraid of knowing he had dyslexia so don't mention it.

SPED Family Liaison stated we knew that Reading Recovery did not work for 25% of the population maybe that was dyslexia?

Ms. MacDonald responded that is why we are looking at the students being referred to SPED. We are tracking the progress those students in 2<sup>nd</sup> & 3<sup>rd</sup> grade in spelling and writing (phonics).

Ms. Kelly thinks it is not only dyslexia. Her child was doing phonics but once someone learns it they have it in their tool box. There is a range of kids who need assistance in terms of phonics.

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

Ms. Dexter is hoping for more people in the classroom to help them. It's hard for teachers with 25 kids in the classroom.

Ms. MacDonald thanked Nathan for coming to speak.

Motion to adjourn by Ms. Dexter seconded by Ms. Kelly at 6:09 PM

#### **10. Resolutions (letters of congratulations, letters of condolence):**

**#19-78, Joint Motion by Ms. Nolan and Committee Member Dexter**, that the School Committee congratulates the Register Forum on receiving first prize for "Excellence in Editorial Writing" in the Greater Boston High School Newspaper Competition, sponsored by Suffolk University, a competition judged by professional journalists.

Further, that both the faculty advisor and students receive congratulations on behalf of the school district and School Committee.

**#19-79, Motion by Mayor McGovern**, that the School Committee hereby goes on record in expressing its deep condolences to the family of Officer Edward Burke for their loss and that the Executive Secretary be and hereby is requested to forward a suitable letter of condolence to the family of Officer Edward Burke on behalf of the entire School Committee.

#### **11. Announcements:**

#### **12. Late Orders:**

That the following be adopted:

**#19-80, Motion by Ms. Bowman**, seconded by Mayor McGovern, that whereas the Cambridge School Committee is committed to honoring the will of the people and creating a working environment where all Committee Members have the ability to honor their civic duty;

Therefore be it resolved, that School Committee Sub-Committee meetings be scheduled during times when Members of a Sub-Committee have the ability to participate and perform their civic duty.

Ms. Nolan exercised her Charter Rights and placed **#19-80** on the Calendar.

**#19-81, Motion by Mayor McGovern**, congratulations to CRLS on receiving a National School Board Association 2019 Magna Award for the Level Up Program. The Magna Award honors districts across the country for programs that break down barriers for underserved students. The Level Up work is an example of collaborative efforts that support the CPS strategic objectives of Equity and Access. Special thanks to CRLS Principal Damon Smith, CPS Administrators Dr. Kenneth Salim, Dr. Carolyn Turk, Dr. Anda Adams, as well as school and district leaders including Jen Hamilton, Tanya Milner, Adrienne Stang, Jan Tingle, Desiree Phillips, and all educators on the Level Up team for their vision, leadership, and dedication.

**#19-82, Motion by Ms. Bowman**, that the Governance Sub-Committee brings forth a new budget process that will assist the public, the Committee and Administration in delivering a more effective and inclusive budget moving forward.

**Motion by Patty Nolan**, that the School Committee sends a letter of condolence to the family of Ms. Joyce Egleston.

#### **13. Communications from City Officers:**

**Distributed Back-up Documents** (copies on file in the School Committee office):

- Agenda
- Adjustments to the FY 2020 Proposed Budget

Cambridge School Committee  
Regular Meeting  
Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room

April 2, 2019

**Statements from Public Comment** (copies on file in the School Committee office)

- ✓ Nada Abullah
- ✓ Dan Monahan

**E-Mail communications** (copies on file in the School Committee office)

The Chair entertained a motion to enter into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing strategy with respect to collective bargaining with the (CEA Units A & B and Unit E) as an open meeting may have a detrimental effect on the bargaining position of the School Committee.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, on the following roll call it was voted to enter into Executive Session for the purpose stated: Mr. Fantini YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Mr. Kimbrough YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Ms. Dexter YEA; Mayor McGovern YEA.

The Chair announced that NO VOTES will be taken in Executive Session and that the Committee WILL NOT reconvene in Open Session.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, it was voted to adjourn (9:10 p.m.)

Attest:

*Dosha E. Beard*

Dosha Beard  
Executive Secretary